**Observations on the State of Indigenous Women’s Human Rights in Russia**

**prepared for**

 **Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women
80th Session: 18 Oct 2021-12 Nov 2021**

**Submission date: May 24, 2021**

**Submitting organizations:**

**Cultural Survival** is an international Indigenous rights organization with Indigenous leadership and consultative status with ECOSOC since 2005. Located in Cambridge, Massachusetts, it is registered as a 501(c)(3) non-profit organization in the United States. CS monitors the protection of Indigenous Peoples' rights in countries throughout the world and publishes findings in print and website: [www.cs.org](http://www.cs.org).

**The American Indian Law Clinic of the University of Colorado,** established in 1992 as one of the first of its kind, represents individuals, Indian Tribes and Tribal entities in a variety of settings involving federal Indian law and involving the law and legal systems in Indian County, as well as work with the United Nations. <https://www.colorado.edu/law/academics/clinics/american-indian-law-clinic>

**The International Indigenous Fund for development and solidarity «Batani»** was created by indigenous peoples in 2004 to organize development projects for indigenous peoples in Russia. It has implemented several successful programs in Sakhalin and other regions of the Russian Far East. The fund also developed mechanisms for negotiations between indigenous communities and private businesses and promoted international cooperation between indigenous peoples of Russia, the US, Canada, Norway, Bolivia, and other countries. <https://batani.org/>

#

# Executive Summary

Indigenous women in the Russian Federation face mounting pressure to quickly adapt to a changing landscape as climate change and environmental destruction caused by extractive industries continue to impede on their traditional ways of living causing detrimental effects to their well-being. The Russian Federation is doing little to protect the rights of Indigenous women, and are not taking adequate steps to provide Indigenous women and girls access to education or healthcare. State actors are actively silencing and threatening Indigenous human rights defenders and their participation in public and political spaces.

# Background Information

The Russian Federation is home to millions of people of diverse ethnicities, including an Indigenous population spread across roughly two-thirds of Russian territory representing 2% of that region’s population.[[1]](#endnote-1) There are 46 legally recognized Peoples in the Russian Federation, defined as “Indigenous small-numbered Peoples of the North, Siberia, and the Far East.” Within the Federation, to be recognized as “Indigenous” a group must fit distinct conditions, including numbering under 50,000 individuals, practicing traditional customs, inhabiting a remote area, and maintaining a distinct ethnic identity.[[2]](#endnote-2) This State-imposed definition prevents approximately 140 Indigenous Peoples, including Buryats, Altaians, and Peoples of southwestern Russia, from claiming Indigenous rights through official recognition by Russia. Article 69 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation guarantees “the rights of the Indigenous small-numbered Peoples according to the universally recognized principles and norms of international law and international treaties and agreements of the Russian Federation”[[3]](#endnote-3); however, little has been done to implement this norm, and even less has been done that focuses on the unique needs of Indigenous women. The Russian Federation has consistently abstained from adopting the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples.[[4]](#endnote-4) Due to Russia’s size, the Indigenous Peoples are not easily generalized as one. They live in different geographies and climates, following unique social, economic, and political patterns. However, overall, Indigenous Peoples in Russia remain one of the most impoverished sectors of the population. Their social and economic development, as well as life expectancy, are far below the national average.[[5]](#endnote-5) As political targeting of rights defenders continues, fewer grassroots Indigenous organizations are allowed to exist and speak freely, and there continues to be a lack of data and reporting available on Indigenous women in Russia.

# Concluding Recommendations from Previous CEDAW Review

In 2015, CEDAW made the following recommendations regarding Indigenous women that remain to be implemented:

* 1. *Ensure that Indigenous women are represented in decision-making bodies at the local, regional and federal levels, and adopt measures to ensure the full and effective participation of Indigenous women in all decision-making processes that may affect their rights;*
	2. *Guarantee that indigenous women have full and unrestricted access to their traditional lands and the resources on which they depend for food, water, health and to maintain and develop their distinct cultures and identities as peoples;*
	3. *Regularly collect disaggregated data on Indigenous women and girls, using specific health and social indicators*

For the 2021 session, Russia was asked to report on the following question regarding Indigenous women: *Please explain how federal Act No. 49-FZ of 2001 and the draft federal act submitted to the Government in 2018 (para. 177) ensure that indigenous women have full and unrestricted access to their traditional lands and resources.*

We appreciate CEDAW’s attention to this issue and note that Russia’s response lacks substance and accuracy. In fact, the current law on the Territories of Traditional Natural Resource Use is ineffectual. It does not carry protective or other functions to ensure Indigenous Peoples’ rights. Although the negotiations for this law included Indigenous Peoples, its current iteration does not support the implementation of Indigenous rights as it does not preserve Indigenous rights concepts within the ecosystem of laws related to natural resource use and management in Russia, including the forest code-laws on hunting, fishing, subsoil, etc. Unfortunately, after its adoption of the law of the Territories of Traditional Natural Resource Use (TTPs by Russian acronym), Russia changed all the above-mentioned natural resource laws without safeguarding within them Indigenous Peoples’ rights. There have been zero federally approved TTPs since the law went into effect in 2001. Functionally speaking, this legislation is empty and does not protect Indigenous Peoples generally, nor does it make any mention of Indigenous women’s rights specifically.

# Ongoing Violations of Indigenous Women’s Rights

## Silencing of Indigenous Voices*CEDAW Article 7, Gen Rec 34 section A.15*

There continues to be a distinct lack of Indigenous leadership in local and federal government, which takes a paternalistic view towards Indigenous Peoples.[[6]](#endnote-6) There are no advocacy groups which specifically represent Indigenous women and Indigenous women lack legal and political representation.[[7]](#endnote-7) The state does no institutional promotion of Indigenous women’s rights. Indigenous organizations have been founded by Indigenous women, but women’s issues are rarely named as the focus of advocacy.[[8]](#endnote-8) However, many Indigenous organizations, although not specifically women’s organizations, address issues relevant to Indigenous women’s rights under CEDAW; therefore attacks against these organizations, in violation of CEDAW article 7(c), are attacks against Indigenous women’s political and public participation. There are numerous reports of the Russian government using intimidation tactics like threatening criminal prosecution to dissuade Indigenous rights activists.[[9]](#endnote-9)

Indigenous organizations and their leaders are often labeled “foreign agents” to retaliate and discredit their work.[[10]](#endnote-10) This was recently the case for young reindeer herder ES, who leads a grassroots movement,[[11]](#endnote-11) after he organized a petition “To preserve the home of the Nenets,” advocating against oil and gas production.[[12]](#endnote-12) In 2019, the Moscow City Court dissolved the Center for Support of Indigenous Peoples of the North/Russian Indigenous Training Center (CSIPN/RITC). CSIPN had been labeled in 2015 as a group of ‘foreign agents' for accepting grant funding from international sources.[[13]](#endnote-13) In 2014, six Indigenous leaders were prevented from attending the World Conference on Indigenous Peoples at UN Headquarters in New York.[[14]](#endnote-14) Some of them were beaten by unknown attackers, and passports of others were intentionally torn by border control officers. Two Indigenous women, Sami activists VS and AA, missed their plane to New York because of suspicious events. They were unable to drive to the airport; their car’s tires had been punctured. They took a taxi but were stopped by police three times because, according to police, a car similar to their taxi was wanted by authorities. During one stop, an unknown attacker assaulted the women and tried to steal a purse with passports; the police did nothing to stop him. The delegates missed their flight and were unable to participate in this important public forum.[[15]](#endnote-15)

Many Indigenous representatives who participate in public forums that are critical of Russia, such as at UN events in Geneva, New York or others, are met with smear campaigns in the media or pressure from the police, FSB (Federal Security Service) or their employers. At least three Indigenous women have spoken publicly about this: YT, a Shor activist; DE, a Selkup activist, and VS, a Sami representative.[[16]](#endnote-16) In 2014, YT’s home was burned by unknown arsonists after she spoke out against a coal mining company in her village.[[17]](#endnote-17)

An ethnoecological information center disseminating information on Indigenous Peoples’ rights in Kamchatka peninsula suffered a smear campaign when anonymous authors published articles in Kamchatka mass-media about this center and its Indigenous woman director, NZ. Subsequently, their access to funding was reduced.

Some Indigenous organizations have been taken over by the State. RAIPON, the Russian Association of Indigenous Peoples of the North, was suspended in 2012 by the Russian Ministry of Justice after the group attempted to rally support for a ban on oil drilling on traditional lands.[[18]](#endnote-18) The group was reinstated only after amendments were made to the group’s charter[[19]](#endnote-19) and is no longer representative of community voices.

***State Discrimination and Surveillance of Indigenous Peoples***

CEDAW General Recommendation 34, Section A15, notes that State parties should eliminate all forms of discrimination against disadvantaged and marginalized groups or rural women, including Indigenous women, and ensure that they have access to education, employment, water and sanitation, healthcare, etc. Yet the State-imposed definition, requiring Indigenous Peoples to be 50,000 or fewer in population, discriminates against approximately 140 Indigenous Peoples, including Buryats, Altaians, and Peoples of southwestern Russia, excluding them from claiming Indigenous rights.

In 2020, a new registry, managed by the Federal Agency of Ethnic Affairs, discriminates against Indigenous people, including women, who reside outside their traditional territories or engage in economic activity besides government-defined “traditional” activities, such as handicrafts, animal-skinning, or ice fishing.[[20]](#endnote-20) This is troubling given the increased contamination of Indigenous territories by Russian industries, the impacts of climate change, and the history of Indigenous Peoples’ forced eviction from their lands by the Russian state. The list was developed under the guise of facilitating Indigenous Peoples’ access to benefits. In practice, Indigenous leaders consider it an attempt to discredit Indigenous leadership and defenders who are more likely to be educated or living in urban areas by allowing the government to remove them from the list of registered Indigenous Peoples. Indigenous leader GS explained, “Is anyone sure that our lives will change for the better with this registry? They divide our people with this registry. They separate the intelligentsia from the tundra people, the children from their parents, the pensioners from their grandchildren and the wives from their husbands.”[[21]](#endnote-21)

## Impacts of Climate Change on Indigenous Women *CEDAW Articles 3, 11, 12, 14, CEDAW GR 34 section A.12*

According to the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), the Arctic region is among the most vulnerable in the world to climate change. The climate crisis and the Russian government’s response disproportionately affects Indigenous Peoples in the Arctic, of which half the population are women. Climate change forces communities to abandon their traditional nomadic lifeways, resulting in negative impacts on physical and mental well-being.[[22]](#endnote-22) These impacts are gender-nuanced given the different gender roles within Indigenous communities.[[23]](#endnote-23) The impacts on Indigenous women’s lives and livelihoods violate CEDAW Article 3 (guarantee of basic human rights and fundamental freedoms), Article 11 (equal work), Article 12 (health), and Article 14 (rural work). CEDAW General Recommendation 34 specifically states, “State parties should address specific threats posed to rural women by climate change... extractive industries… they should alleviate and mitigate these threats and ensure that rural women enjoy a safe, clean, and healthy environment. They should effectively address the impact of such risks on rural women in the planning and implementation of all policies concerning the environment, climate change, and ensure full participation of rural women in designing, planning and implementing such policies.”

Indigenous Peoples’ cultures and economic activities depend directly on environmental conditions. Climatic changes affect their ability to live traditionally.[[24]](#endnote-24) As the climate warms, ice and permafrost melt, impacting reindeer, deer, marine mammals and fish migration patterns, on which Indigenous communities rely.[[25]](#endnote-25) Scientists warn that “a few degrees of warming in the Arctic could trigger an abrupt thaw of the permafrost that makes up two-thirds of Russia’s landmass.” The melting permafrost releases additional greenhouse gases, such as carbon and methane, which further exacerbates the climate crisis.[[26]](#endnote-26)

Increased global carbon emissions have caused increasing temperatures and precipitation changes in Siberia. Scientists report that these changes have affected flora and fauna, permafrost levels, hydrology, biogeochemical cycles, and coastal sea ice. Climate change increases the intensity and frequency of extreme weather events, including hurricanes, tornadoes, extreme dry/wet periods, and forest fires. Rapid methane release from below-ground reservoirs increases the risk of explosion of extractive industry infrastructure located on permafrost.[[27]](#endnote-27) From January-August 2019, 130,000 square kilometers burned in Siberia, harming the Indigenous Peoples who rely on the forest. Understaffed and under-equipped firefighters only put out 4% of the fires.[[28]](#endnote-28) Officials ignored the ecological catastrophe, falsely claiming that because the fires were in “remote, uninhabited areas” they were not a direct threat to people or livelihoods. As Greenpeace observed, there are Indigenous Peoples whose lives and livelihoods the fires threatened.[[29]](#endnote-29) According to NK, an Indigenous activist, 33-90% of the forests on which Indigenous Peoples depend have burned. NK stated, “These fires are effectively the destruction of the whole of our traditional economic activities. We have no idea what will be next, but we are preparing for the worst.”[[30]](#endnote-30)

Melting permafrost makes Indigenous communities more vulnerable to infrastructure collapse. It is believed to be one cause of one of the worst oil spills in the history of the Arctic. In May 2020, “15,000 metric tons of diesel fuel were released into the Ambarnaya River and 6,000 into the surrounding soil.”[[31]](#endnote-31) Much of Russia’s extractive infrastructure sits on permafrost; as it melts, more disastrous spills are likely.[[32]](#endnote-32) Melting permafrost causes flooding, destroying homes and other infrastructure.[[33]](#endnote-33) Melting ice increases the danger of traveling winter roads that Indigenous communities rely on to procure necessities and to go hunting.[[34]](#endnote-34)

Climate change affects overall Arctic biodiversity. These environmental changes threaten reindeer husbandry, fishing, and food and medicinal plants. Reindeer require particular foods; as the flora changes, Indigenous communities have to relocate to feed their herds. As plant populations shrink, reindeer weight has been decreasing, lowering the animals’ value.[[35]](#endnote-35) Melting ice caps increase rainfall, resulting in more refreezing events and damaging pasture conditions, as reindeer cannot forage for lichens beneath the ice.[[36]](#endnote-36) The reindeer population of Russia, vital to the cultures of over 40 Indigenous Peoples, is on the verge of extinction. The Sàmi rely on reindeer herding for their livelihood and identity[[37]](#endnote-37) as do the Nenets Peoples, who depend on their herds for food, clothes, transport and shelter and have migrated across their homelands for centuries. Russia’s Natural Resources and Ecology Ministry stated that there are now 400,000-450,000 reindeer in the Far North region, down from one million in 2000.[[38]](#endnote-38)

Permafrost melting poses a particular risk to reindeer, as long-dormant pathogens are exposed. Despite this, the government stopped vaccinating reindeer against anthrax in 2007.[[39]](#endnote-39) A new oil depot planned for Siberia, which would exacerbate permafrost destruction, could cause another anthrax outbreak.[[40]](#endnote-40) A 2016 outbreak among the Nenets People killed a 12-year old boy and thousands of reindeer.[[41]](#endnote-41) Humans can contract anthrax from animals. In 2016, the government planned to slaughter 250,000 of the 700,000 reindeer living on the Yamal Peninsula rather than treat them, without consulting communities nor planning for compensation.[[42]](#endnote-42) Indigenous-led campaigns succeeded in narrowly avoiding the slaughter.

Minority Rights Group International’s climate justice report summarized: “As the Arctic climate shifts, the use of traditional knowledge for future operational decision-making is likely to prove more challenging. While potentially remaining relevant in supporting community structures and coherence, climate change is likely to change the relationship of Sámi to their northern environments and to their traditional livelihoods. These pressures are likely to be exacerbated by national infrastructure developments such as windfarms and hydroelectric dams[[43]](#endnote-43)...For the thousands of reindeer herders in the northern regions of Russia and the Nordic countries, ice loss has disrupted traditional migration routes and exposed their animals to hunger, disease and population decline. Furthermore, as the changing environment has opened up larger swathes of Indigenous territory to development, communities are now contending with encroachments on their land by companies and governments with mining, oil and other projects that endanger their way of life.”[[44]](#endnote-44)

To prevent loss of traditional lifeways, scientists, researchers, and policymakers must engage with local Indigenous scientists and communities to develop plans and strategies.[[45]](#endnote-45) Traditional knowledge and the firsthand experiences of Arctic women and their communities are invaluable tools for addressing climate change, but international policymaking spaces rarely invite or value their participation. Indigenous women must be included in discussions regarding adaptation and mitigation strategies with the Free, Prior and Informed Consent (FPIC) of communities and including protocols to protect communities’ intellectual property from exploitation.[[46]](#endnote-46)

## C. Violations of Indigenous Women’s Rights as a result of Impacts from Extractive Industries *CEDAW Art.14, 15, CEDAW GR 34*

Extractive industries continually violate Indigenous women's rights as stipulated under CEDAW, including Articles 14, 15, and General Recommendation 34 G.2.d, which states that States should “Obtain the free and informed consent of rural women prior to the approval of any acquisitions or projects affecting rural lands or territories and resources.” Section F.54.e recommends states ensure that “rural development projects are implemented only after participatory gender and environmental impact assessments have been conducted with full participation of rural women, and after obtaining FPIC. Effective measures should be taken to mitigate possible adverse environmental and gender impacts.”

Russia has failed to regulate extractive industries which are having massive impacts on Indigenous Peoples including Indigenous women. It has made no effort to gain their FPIC.[[47]](#endnote-47)

1. *Nickel Mining*

The most recent example has been Nornickel’s nickel mining and smelting operations, which have caused extensive environmental damage to the territories of Sámi, Nenets, Nganasan, Enets, Dolgan and Evenk communities in the Arctic. These communities have occupied the land for generations and suffer from Nornickel’s impacts on their herding, hunting, fishing, and other activities, as well as their physical health and well-being.

Nornickel has long been a top polluter in the region and has caused substantial environmental damage. On May 29, 2020, a Nornickel fuel storage tank failed, releasing 21,000 tons of diesel fuel into rivers.[[48]](#endnote-48) The spill is deemed one of the worst environmental disasters in the Arctic since the 1989 Exxon Valdez oil spill in Alaska. The company’s processing practices are also a major source of air pollution from sulfur dioxide emissions with significant human health impacts. Emissions levels in January 2020 triggered the health-warning alarm in downwind border communities in Norway, at levels up to 7-800 microgram per cubic meter, 50% over maximum allowed concentrations. These sulfur clouds also kill trees and vegetation surrounding smelters on the Kola Peninsula and Taimyr region.[[49]](#endnote-49) A 2018 Greenpeace analysis of NASA data ranked Norilsk, Russia as the number one hotspot for sulfur dioxide emissions in the world.[[50]](#endnote-50) The company has exhibited complete disregard for proper disposal of toxic byproducts. On June 28th, 2020, one of Nornickel’s enrichment plants dumped wastewater into nearby tundra, spilling approximately 6,000 cubic meters of waste.[[51]](#endnote-51) On June 29, 2020, a Nornickel landfill burst into flames, harming wildlife and humans. The Arctic region is particularly vulnerable to environmental damage; it can take decades to recover. Nornickel has devastated substantial land areas that Arctic Indigenous Peoples, including Indigenous women, rely upon for their cultures, food security and sovereignty, and well-being.

1. *Coal Mining*

The Russian coal industry has systematically displaced Siberian Indigenous Peoples from their traditional lands in the Kuzbass region, one of the world’s largest coal deposits where over 50% of Russian coal is extracted.[[52]](#endnote-52) Coal excavation has forced eight out of nine Shor settlements in the region to leave their ancestral lands.[[53]](#endnote-53) In 2016, over 2000 residents of Myski district signed an appeal to stop the ongoing destruction of Shor ancestral land, which they fear is leading to their genocide.[[54]](#endnote-54) The Russian government is not properly regulating mining operations.[[55]](#endnote-55) Coal mining has had disastrous consequences for Indigenous Peoples, especially for Indigenous women. Studies show that impacted communities see lower birth weights and higher instances of various cancers and diseases.[[56]](#endnote-56) Protests over mines and open-air coal transport have increased in recent years.[[57]](#endnote-57) Open-air coal transport distributes pounds of coal dust with every load, affecting even communities not located near mines.[[58]](#endnote-58) Despite clear understanding of coal’s impacts, Russia plans to intensify coal production through 2030.

1. *Arctic Development*

Russia often directs economic development funds to projects that conflict with local Indigenous Peoples’ interests, enacting policies without FPIC. In 2017, Russia approved a plan for further development of the Arctic, devoting $3.6 billion to boost the Arctic economy, particularly oil and gas extraction. The plan indicates “support of Indigenous people”[[59]](#endnote-59) however, the majority of funds went to nuclear icebreaker vessels that expand shipping routes.[[60]](#endnote-60) Putin has announced that by 2035, Russia’s Arctic fleet will operate at least 13 heavy-duty icebreakers, including nine powered by nuclear reactors.[[61]](#endnote-61) In 2019, nuclear-powered icebreakers accompanied a total of 510 vessels, an increase of 54% compared to 2018. With global warming, commercial shipping in the Arctic is likely to experience more accidents triggered by extreme weather events, such as stronger winds, storms, and higher waves. Increased traffic, along with extreme weather, could cause collisions of tankers and nuclear icebreakers, with serious potential for release of radioactive contaminants.[[62]](#endnote-62) In addition to potential accidents, maintenance of the ships, refueling, and nuclear waste storage all pose risks for people who reside, hunt, fish, and gather in these regions.

Icebreaker ships further deplete vulnerable Arctic ice. Because cargo ships can now reach more areas, previously untouched ecosystems and habitats are quickly falling victim to multiple kinds of pollution. Besides the chance of oil spills, ships dump sewage, garbage, and other waste into the ocean. Ships powered by heavy fuel oil, the dirtiest fuel on the planet, are especially threatening; although the International Maritime Organization (IMO) supports establishing new regulations, the process will likely take years.[[63]](#endnote-63) In cold waters, oil breakdown rates are much slower than in warm waters, so contamination persists for longer.[[64]](#endnote-64),[[65]](#endnote-65) An oil spill would damage fragile Arctic ecosystems and harm Indigenous Peoples, especially women, who often occupy the role of gatherers.[[66]](#endnote-66) Without the ability to gather as they traditionally did, women cannot subsist without additional supplies, which are costly in remote regions.

1. *Oil and Gas Pipelines*

Russia is one of the world's biggest oil and gas producers, with 25.2% of discovered global gas reserves and 6.5% of world oil reserves. The Arctic holds about 13% of the world’s undiscovered oil and 30% of undiscovered gas, the U.S. Geological Survey estimates.[[67]](#endnote-67)

Pipelines and natural resource extraction are crucial to the relationship between China and Russia.[[68]](#endnote-68) A massive east-west pipeline, Gazprom’s Power of Siberia pipeline, which started construction in 2012 and became operational in October 2019, has decreased access to Indigenous Peoples’ traditional lands and resources.[[69]](#endnote-69) There are continuing concerns regarding the pipeline’s impact on the Indigenous Peoples along its 3,968 km length.[[70]](#endnote-70) Gazprom’s meetings regarding plans for the pipeline did not adequately engage the Indigenous communities affected by its operations and did not achieve their FPIC. Increases to capacity are already being proposed as of June 2020.[[71]](#endnote-71)

Leaks from aging pipeline infrastructure have contaminated Indigenous lands. On July 13 and on November 25, 2020, leaks occurred on the 1970s Okha-Komsomolsk-on-Amur crude oil pipeline. The company, Rosneft-Sakhalinmorneftegaz, prevented public access to the site, making it impossible to assess the situation and determine the degree to which oil entered Lake Goloye, which would affect the local people of Khabarovsky province and everyone who relies on the Amur River downstream.[[72]](#endnote-72) This represents a systemic problem: after the collapse of the Soviet Union, repairs to facilities such as pipelines were delayed. In 1999, it was estimated that more than 45,000km of the national pipeline system needed replacement. Although this number has since decreased, significant damage was done and ongoing leaks continue to affect Indigenous women, their communities, and lands. Massive updates are needed for pipelines that traverse the rapidly melting permafrost. Leaks from pipelines and flaring of waste gas have also exacerbated forest fires. This all contributes to declines in fish and wild game in Indigenous Peoples’ territories, impeding traditional ways of life.

1. *Commercial Fishing*

CEDAW’s General Recommendation states, “The Committee considers rural women’s rights to land, natural resources, including... fisheries as fundamental human rights.” It elaborates in section G1.59 (b): “State parties should enhance rural women’s role in fisheries and aquaculture, as well as their knowledge on sustainable use of fishery resources.” The Indigenous Nanai people have for centuries depended on salmon that spawn in the Amur River. Commercial overfishing has decimated the salmon population; Indigenous women and their families often cannot fish sufficiently for subsistence nor afford to purchase fish. “The whole of the Amur lives off this fish. Yes, we aren’t wealthy, but we have this. It’s our wealth, we don’t need anything else, ” explained LO, Indigenous woman president of an Indigenous People’s association. Since 2017, LO’s group has monitored salmon spawning grounds, submitting data to the structures responsible for fishing management. LO summarized their 2019 observations: “Very few fish… the fish were not there, especially pink salmon. It is possible that salmon population in these rivers is completely exhausted. This year, our public monitoring confirmed that it is necessary to introduce a ban on the commercial fishing of summer salmon in the Amur River for at least 5-8 years, and support monitoring of filling spawning grounds with summer chum and pink salmon. In future, we would like to continue this work, which shows the real level of Amur salmon reproduction.”[[73]](#endnote-73) In 2020, representatives of the government research institution *KhabarovskNIRO* joined the monitoring activities.*[[74]](#endnote-74)*  Commercial salmon fisheries in Nikolayevsk-on-Amur have admitted to overfishing. Some of those companies were supported by a federal program seeking to boost the economy by giving companies tax breaks and other benefits.[[75]](#endnote-75) Local officials report that their efforts to stop overfishing, poaching, and roe-stripping –tearing egg sacks out of female salmon before they can spawn– were fruitless; violators were often warned before they could be caught or fined, and monitoring budgets have been cut. While Nikolayevsk-on-Amur previously had over 40 inspectors, just four remain.[[76]](#endnote-76)

## D. Indigenous Women’s Health *CEDAW article 12*

Indigenous women in Russia face disproportionate health challenges, which the climate crisis exacerbates. Indigenous Peoples’ survival in Russia depends upon women’s reproductive health and behavior. Research indicates that Indigenous women in Russia are disproportionately burdened by infant mortality compared to non-Indigenous women, contributing to the depopulation of Indigenous Peoples.[[77]](#endnote-77) The government’s failure to provide access to healthcare services with qualified medical staff or establish effective health policies violates Article 12 of CEDAW.

Russian policies aim to incentivize women to have children. However, Arctic Indigenous women face barriers in access to perinatal maternity care and qualified medical staff. Evacuation of childbearing women from remote areas during emergencies is challenging.[[78]](#endnote-78) The State’s failure to report on Indigenous women’s health contributes to policy shortcomings.121 Monitoring and disseminating reliable data on Indigenous women’s health is essential to developing effective policies.

Some nomadic Peoples of the North have been forced to adapt by establishing more permanent settlements and abandoning nomadic ways. Other communities have adapted by moving further North, further from towns, to seek more familiar environments. These abrupt transitions are accompanied by increased psychological instability, reduced immunity, and greater frequency of diseases including cardiovascular disease and diabetes.[[79]](#endnote-79) An increase in sedentary lifestyles has also increased rates of obesity, which affects women’s reproductive health.[[80]](#endnote-80)

As nomadic communities in the North migrate further from town, they become more isolated, which decreases access to healthcare. Human rights organization Minority Rights Group International reports, “Given their isolation in the Russian far north, climate change is already expected to have far-reaching consequences on access to healthcare, as well as on the social fabric of local Indigenous communities reliant upon a threatened species and its grazing lands for their subsistence and cultural life. Women are likely to be at a disadvantage when they require antenatal care, giving an indication of the extra vulnerabilities faced by more vulnerable segments of the Indigenous communities in these regions.”[[81]](#endnote-81) This may contribute to the fact that Russia’s Indigenous women are “six times more likely to die in childbirth than non-Indigenous women.”[[82]](#endnote-82) These factors result in a startling fact: a lowered life expectancy for Indigenous Peoples of the North.[[83]](#endnote-83)

Access to services for women who experience domestic violence has been limited since a 2017 law decriminalized some acts of domestic violence.[[84]](#endnote-84) First-time offenses do not result in incarceration and aggravated assaults incur fines of a maximum of $500 or 15 days in jail.[[85]](#endnote-85) Only repeated aggravated assaults may result in criminal charges.[[86]](#endnote-86) Most shelters and resources have closed; a 2020 study found that a majority of domestic violence survivors are unlikely to pursue charges due to State policies normalizing it.[[87]](#endnote-87) Women who kill their abusers in self-defense face prison time without consideration of their victimization.[[88]](#endnote-88)

Indigenous women’s health is further burdened by a lack of regulation on polluting industries. Industrial pollution contaminates traditional foods, disproportionately affecting Indigenous women due to complications for maternity. A study of 697 Russian Indigenous people living in the Arctic found high concentrations of persistent contaminants in food, homes, and blood, resulting in unacceptable risk of infectious diseases including tuberculosis, respiratory diseases, pathological processes in endocrine and urogenital systems, impaired development and adverse pregnancy outcomes.[[89]](#endnote-89) Breastfed children are particularly vulnerable because they have a higher intake of environmental pollutants relative to their body weight and are in a stage of rapid neurological development.

The primary source of exposure to toxic chemicals for Indigenous Peoples is contaminated food supply, which bioaccumulate in fish and game. Indigenous Peoples in Arctic Russia are not informed of the risks related to these pollutants nor exposure prevention. Furthermore, there is no regulation that defines and enforces a safe concentration of environmental contaminants in traditional foods including fish and sea mammals.

*COVID-19*

Starting in 2020, COVID-19 has threatened Indigenous women’s health as the pandemic has spread throughout the country. Many demographers agree that the most reliable data for COVID-19 deaths in Russia is the *total excess fatality count* - the number of deaths in excess of average annual deaths pre-pandemic - which, since the start of the pandemic, is over 422,000 as of February 2020. Russia has one of the world’s highest excess death tolls, even adjusting for population size.[[90]](#endnote-90) COVID-19 data in Indigenous communities are not disaggregated in official reporting. Cases of COVID-19 have been reported in even the most remote regions.

Over the last 15 years, the Russian state healthcare system has been restructured, closing many small, rural medical facilities. The remote villages of the Russian Arctic, Siberia, and the Far East, where most Indigenous Peoples live, became the most sensitive to these closures due to the size of the territory, harsh climatic conditions, and low transport accessibility. Russia's under-funded healthcare system has been poorly prepared for the pandemic: protective equipment is often lacking, and there are not enough beds or other equipment for intensive-care patients, especially in remote rural territories. Many medical workers reported that they are poorly protected and do not receive the required government salary payments. Russia’s size and the cost of transportation initially prevented the virus’s quick spread in remote territories of the Russian Arctic, Siberia, and the Far East. However, later it was brought to the Northern regions by extractive industry workers. Local authorities in remote areas had no resources to prevent spread. The federal government tried to respond, sending military field hospitals, which were organized in Zabaikalsk, Krasnoyarsk, Murmansk, and other regions. Yet these efforts sometimes led to more spread of viruses. The outbreak in the Kamchatka region started among construction workers of a new hospital led by the Ministry of Defense. There were several cases around the Russian Arctic where the virus spread in restricted-access oil and gas camps. In May 2020, of 2,416 COVID-19 infections in the entire Murmansk region, 2,045 were registered at the construction camp for a new NOVATEK liquid natural gas facility near Belokamenka village. Similar situations occurred in other northern regions including the Krasnoyarsk Krai (gold-mining company "Polus" camp near Eruda village), the Yamal region ("Novatek" company LNG project in Sabetta), Yakutia Republic ("Gazprom" company Chayanda natural gas project), Kamchatka peninsula (fishing companies)[[91]](#endnote-91).

Although RAIPON reports that local authorities have been providing resources to combat the virus in remote regions, NGOs and local residents describe Indigenous people facing major barriers to treatment. EK, a female Indigenous medical worker reports, “I begged doctors to start a course of treatment, but as we received once again the negative tests for COVID-19, they said that we were not subjects for treatment. So they sent me back home even though […] I felt terrible and could only drink water.” The San Francisco Times reports, “[EK] was required to return to work despite a high fever, a loss of smell and intense body aches. However, after she developed a fever of 39.4 degrees and started to vomit, she was taken to the hospital. There, she underwent tests which showed that she was positive for COVID-19 and that she had lung damage. She...had developed partial paralysis in her legs and lost some of her speaking ability, adding: “How long [will] all this shame […] continue in our hospital? All people know what terrible things are going [on] at our hospital but everybody [is] silent.””[[92]](#endnote-92)

Another problem has been the lack of consistent and reliable information from the government about COVID-19 and the vaccine that is culturally and linguistically appropriate. This will be especially important as Russia progresses in vaccination campaigns to ensure Indigenous Peoples, including Indigenous women, understand the benefits of and have access to immunizations.

## E. Access to Culturally Appropriate Education*CEDAW Article 10, GR/34*

CEDAW GR/34 in section IV D.43 states that a) “States should protect rural girls and women’s right to education and ensure that quality education is accessible and affordable for all rural girls and women… by improving education infrastructure in rural areas... and ensuring education is provided in local languages and in a culturally appropriate manner”, and b) “systematic training [should be] provided for teaching personnel… to combat discriminatory sex and/or gener based ethnic and other stereotypes that limit rural girls’ educational opportunities.” However, for Russian Indigenous girls, the educational system reflects the dominant culture at the expense of Indigenous languages and cultures.[[93]](#endnote-93) Indigenous youth report experiencing stereotyping within mainstream Russian education settings and are encouraged to assimilate.[[94]](#endnote-94)

Many Indigenous youth who attend university report feelings of isolation and othering which impact their social and academic success.[[95]](#endnote-95) Because universities are not located within rural areas, youth who attend reported that they cannot see their families, sometimes for several years; transportation costs are prohibitive.[[96]](#endnote-96) Indigenous students are more likely to drop out and return home without completing their degrees.[[97]](#endnote-97) Indigenous youth who do finish their programs report difficulty finding jobs and discrimination when applying to government jobs, wherein Indigenous applicants are not hired even when they are better educated than non-Indigenous applicants.[[98]](#endnote-98) Private employers are reported to be wary of hiring Indigenous youth because they consider them to “lack experience.”[[99]](#endnote-99)

Support for Indigenous-language instruction in school in Russia is minimal. In the absence of policies and programs that promote and facilitate the study of native languages by youth, the number of Indigenous language speakers is deteriorating rapidly with an aging population.

Currently only 23 of 40 Indigenous languages of the North, Siberia and the Far East of Russia are used in published textbooks. None are used as the language of formal instruction. Indigenous language study is only offered in elective, non-required courses, meeting a few times per week rather than as an immersive program, which linguistics experts agree is ineffective as a means of additive bilingualism.[[100]](#endnote-100)

In Karelia, the Karelian language is not considered the second official language of the Republic; it is the only Republic to recognize Russian as its only official language.[[101]](#endnote-101) Less than 1% of schoolchildren in the Republic studied Karelian as a school subject.[[102]](#endnote-102) Similarly, in the Republic of Mari El, schools used a federal policy to downsize teaching staff, replacing Mari language lessons with English or Russian.[[103]](#endnote-103) As a result, students opting to learn Mari in school decreased to only 10.5% of students in the 2018/2019 school term.[[104]](#endnote-104)

A primary cause of this issue is the continued lack of Indigenous participation in political and decision-making spheres, in violation of CEDAW’s previous recommendations to Russia to “Ensure that indigenous women are represented in decision-making bodies at the local, regional and federal levels, and adopt measures to ensure the full and effective participation of Indigenous women in all decision-making processes that may affect their rights.”

# V. Recommendations

We urge the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women to consider the following recommendations to Russia:

1. Consult with Indigenous women, especially from Arctic regions, in creating policies for mitigation and adaptation to climate change.
2. Facilitate the full and independent assessment of the environmental damage of mining for nickel and other metals in Russia’s Taymyr Peninsula and Murmansk Oblast, including an assessment of the harm from the Norilsk diesel oil spill and taking into consideration the damage done by industrial production to traditional economic activities of Indigenous Peoples.
3. Compensate Indigenous communities for the damages done to their traditional lands by nickel and coal mining operations in alignment with CEDAW General Recommendation 34, article 28 of the UNDRIP, and the Russian constitution art.8, para.8.
4. Prepare and implement a plan for re-cultivating contaminated lands in the Taymyr Peninsula and Murmansk Oblast.
5. Ensure that extractive industries adhere to the minimum standards set by UNDRIP, CEDAW, ILO Convention 169, and other bodies, to obtain Free Prior Informed Consent of Indigenous Peoples, including Indigenous women, prior to the approval of any project affecting Indigenous lands or territories and other resources, particularly in connection with the development, utilization or exploitation of mineral, water or other resources.
6. Ensure that strategic plans for the development of the Arctic gain the Free, Prior and Informed Consent of Indigenous Peoples.
7. Devote adequate resources, work in collaboration with Indigenous Peoples to monitor and protect the threatened salmon populations, especially on the Amur river and in Kamchatka; and, ensure that commercial fishing bans, if enacted, do not violate Indigenous women’s fishing rights and access to food.
8. Regulate the use of and disposal of toxic chemicals by Russian industries to prevent exposure of Indigenous women, and educate rural communities on the risks and prevention of exposure through food sources and surface transmission.
9. Ensure Indigenous women have access to culturally and linguistically relevant, high quality healthcare, especially pre/postnatal care.
10. Take steps to ensure Indigenous Peoples, including Indigenous women, have timely access to COVID-19 vaccines.
11. Increase access to culturally and linguistically relevant education for Indigenous girls and women, especially towards the revitalization of Native languages.
12. Gather disaggregated data on Indigenous Peoples with special attention to women and indicators of living conditions including health issues.
13. Ensure Indigenous women’s’ right to non-discrimination by facilitating the self-determination of Indigenous Peoples to their own cultural identities.
14. Draft a national plan of action based on the 2014 Outcome Document of the World Conference on Indigenous Peoples.
15. Invite the UN Special Rapporteurs on Indigenous Peoples and on Human Rights Defenders to visit Russia.
16. Endorse and implement the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples.
17. Ratify ILO Convention 169

Endnotes:

1. First Peoples Worldwide, Who are the Indigenous Peoples of Russia, Cultural Survival ([Feb. 19, 2014](https://www.culturalsurvival.org/news/who-are-indigenous-peoples-russia)). [↑](#endnote-ref-1)
2. Id. [↑](#endnote-ref-2)
3. Article 69 of the Russian Federation’s Constitution. [↑](#endnote-ref-3)
4. Id. [↑](#endnote-ref-4)
5. https://indigenous-russia.com/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/Aborigen-Forum-position-paper-on-COVID-19-1.pdf [↑](#endnote-ref-5)
6. Arbakhan K. Magomedov, "Where Is Our Land?": Challenges for Indigenous Groups in the Russian Arctic Wilson Center (2019), https://www.wilsoncenter.org/blog-post/where-our-land-challenges-for-indigenous-groups-the-russian-arctic (last visited Nov 6, 2020). [↑](#endnote-ref-6)
7. Observations on the State of Indigenous Human Rights in the Russian Federations (2018), https://www.culturalsurvival.org/sites/default/files/UPR-Report-Russian-Federation-2017.pdf (last visited Nov 12, 2020). [↑](#endnote-ref-7)
8. Arbakhan K. Magomedov, "Where Is Our Land?": Challenges for Indigenous Groups in the Russian Arctic Wilson Center (2019), https://www.wilsoncenter.org/blog-post/where-our-land-challenges-for-indigenous-groups-the-russian-arctic (last visited Nov 6, 2020). [↑](#endnote-ref-8)
9. New Report Highlights Indigenous Rights Violations in Russia, Cultural Survival (2019), https://www.culturalsurvival.org/news/new-report-highlights-indigenous-rights-violations-russia [↑](#endnote-ref-9)
10. Id. [↑](#endnote-ref-10)
11. [redacted] [↑](#endnote-ref-11)
12. Arbakhan K. Magomedov, Oil Derricks or Reindeer? A Clash of Economics and Traditional Lifeway in Russia's Far North Wilson Center (2019), https://www.wilsoncenter.org/blog-post/oil-derricks-or-reindeer-clash-economics-and-traditional-lifeway-russias-far-north (last visited Nov 6, 2020). [↑](#endnote-ref-12)
13. The Barents Observer, Sami Parliaments, EU Concerned by Russia Shutting Down Indigenous Rights Group The Moscow Times (2019), https://www.themoscowtimes.com/2019/11/13/sami-parliaments-eu-concerned-by-russia-shutting-down-indigenous-rights-group-a68153 (last visited Nov 15, 2020). [↑](#endnote-ref-13)
14. New Report Highlights Indigenous Rights Violations in Russia, Cultural Survival (2019), https://www.culturalsurvival.org/news/new-report-highlights-indigenous-rights-violations-russia (last visited Nov 9, 2020). [↑](#endnote-ref-14)
15. Arctic Consult, <https://arctic-consult.com/archives/10604> (2014) [↑](#endnote-ref-15)
16. New Report Highlights Indigenous Rights Violations in Russia, Cultural Survival (2019), https://www.culturalsurvival.org/news/new-report-highlights-indigenous-rights-violations-russia [↑](#endnote-ref-16)
17. 2015 Submission to the Committee on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination regarding Shor communities in Kemerovo Oblast - https://arctic-consult.com/archives/12502 [↑](#endnote-ref-17)
18. Russia: Stop the Silencing of Indigenous Voices. Reinstate RAIPON., Cultural Survival (2012), https://www.culturalsurvival.org/take-action/russia-stop-silencing-indigenous-voices-reinstate-raipon (last visited Nov 16, 2020). [↑](#endnote-ref-18)
19. Campaign Victory! Russia: RAIPON Reinstated, Cultural Survival (2013), https://www.culturalsurvival.org/news/campaign-victory-russia-raipon-reinstated (last visited Nov 16, 2020). [↑](#endnote-ref-19)
20. Tatiana Britskaya, “They are no longer counted as indigenous people” Barents Observer, [October 2020.](https://thebarentsobserver.com/en/indigenous-peoples/2020/10/they-are-no-longer-counted-indigenous-people)  [↑](#endnote-ref-20)
21. Id. [↑](#endnote-ref-21)
22. Terry V. Callaghan, Olga Kulikova, Lidia Rakhmanova, Elmer Topp-Jorgensen, Niklas Labba, Lars-Anders Kuhmanen, Sergey Kirpotin, Olga Shaduyko, Henry Burgess, Arja Rautio, Ruth S. Hindshaw, Leonid L. Golubyatnikov, Gareth J. Marshall, Andrey Lobanov, Andrey Soromotin, Alexander Sokolov, Natalia Sokolova, Praskovia Filant, Margareta Johansson, Improving dialogue among researchers, local and indigenou peoples and decision-makers to address issues of climate change in the North, Springer Link 1161, 1167 ([Nov. 12, 2019](https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s13280-019-01277-9)). [↑](#endnote-ref-22)
23. Bogdanova E, Andronov S, Lobanov A, Kochkin R, Popov A, Asztalos Morell I, Odland J. Indigenous women's reproductive health in the Arctic zone of Western Siberia: challenges and solutions. Int J Circumpolar Health. 2021 Dec;80(1):1855913. doi: 10.1080/22423982.2020.1855913. PMID: 33287680; PMCID: PMC7733886. [↑](#endnote-ref-23)
24. Maria Stambler, The Impact of Climate Change on Indigenous Peoples Has Received Little Attention in Russia Climate Scorecard (2020), https://www.climatescorecard.org/2020/08/the-impact-of-climate-change-on-indigenous-peoples-has-received-little-attention-in-russia/. [↑](#endnote-ref-24)
25. Id. [↑](#endnote-ref-25)
26. The Moscow Times, Slight Arctic Warming Could Trigger Abrupt Permafrost Collapse (2020), https://www.themoscowtimes.com/2020/10/20/slight-arctic-warming-could-trigger-abrupt-permafrost-collapse-study-a71805. [↑](#endnote-ref-26)
27. Terry V. Callaghan, Olga Kulikova, Lidia Rakhmanova, Elmer Topp-Jorgensen, Niklas Labba, Lars-Anders Kuhmanen, Sergey Kirpotin, Olga Shaduyko, Henry Burgess, Arja Rautio, Ruth S. Hindshaw, Leonid L. Golubyatnikov, Gareth J. Marshall, Andrey Lobanov, Andrey Soromotin, Alexander Sokolov, Natalia Sokolova, Praskovia Filant, Margareta Johansson, Improving dialogue among researchers, local and indigenou peoples and decision-makers to address issues of climate change in the North, Springer Link 1161, 1163 ([Nov. 12, 2019](https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s13280-019-01277-9)). [↑](#endnote-ref-27)
28. Siberian fires having catastrophic effects on indigenous peoples and livelihoods, IWGIA ([Oct. 15, 2019](https://www.iwgia.org/en/russia/3516-siberian-fires-having-catastrophic-effects-on-indigenous-peoples-and-livelihoods.html)). [↑](#endnote-ref-28)
29. Shamans Summon Rains to Put Out Siberian Wildfires, The Moscow Times ([July 31, 201 9](https://www.themoscowtimes.com/2019/07/31/shamans-summon-rains-to-put-out-siberian-wildfires-a66645)). [↑](#endnote-ref-29)
30. Siberian fires having catastrophic effects on indigenous peoples and livelihoods, IWGIA ([Oct. 15, 2019](https://www.iwgia.org/en/russia/3516-siberian-fires-having-catastrophic-effects-on-indigenous-peoples-and-livelihoods.html)). [↑](#endnote-ref-30)
31. Evan Gershkovich, In Siberian Fuel Spill, Climate Change Is Seen as Major Factor, The Moscow Times ([June 5, 2020](https://www.themoscowtimes.com/2020/06/05/in-siberian-fuel-spill-climate-change-is-seen-as-major-factor-a70494)). [↑](#endnote-ref-31)
32. Evan Gershkovich, In Siberian Fuel Spill, Climate Change Is Seen as Major Factor, The Moscow Times ([June 5, 2020](https://www.themoscowtimes.com/2020/06/05/in-siberian-fuel-spill-climate-change-is-seen-as-major-factor-a70494)). [↑](#endnote-ref-32)
33. Maria Stambler, The Impact of Climate Change on Indigenous Peoples Has Received Little Attention in Russia, Climate Scorecard ([Aug. 31, 2020](https://www.climatescorecard.org/2020/08/the-impact-of-climate-change-on-indigenous-peoples-has-received-little-attention-in-russia/)). [↑](#endnote-ref-33)
34. Maria Stambler, The Impact of Climate Change on Indigenous Peoples Has Received Little Attention in Russia, Climate Scorecard ([Aug. 31, 2020](https://www.climatescorecard.org/2020/08/the-impact-of-climate-change-on-indigenous-peoples-has-received-little-attention-in-russia/)). [↑](#endnote-ref-34)
35. Terry V. Callaghan, Olga Kulikova, Lidia Rakhmanova, Elmer Topp-Jorgensen, Niklas Labba, Lars-Anders Kuhmanen, Sergey Kirpotin, Olga Shaduyko, Henry Burgess, Arja Rautio, Ruth S. Hindshaw, Leonid L. Golubyatnikov, Gareth J. Marshall, Andrey Lobanov, Andrey Soromotin, Alexander Sokolov, Natalia Sokolova, Praskovia Filant, Margareta Johansson, Improving dialogue among researchers, local and indigenous peoples and decision-makers to address issues of climate change in the North, Springer Link 1161, 1165 ([Nov. 12, 2019](https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s13280-019-01277-9)). [↑](#endnote-ref-35)
36. Minority and Indigenous Trends 2019, Minority Rights p. 30 ([2019](https://minorityrights.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/2019_MR_Report_170x240_V7_WEB.pdf)). [↑](#endnote-ref-36)
37. Minority and Indigenous Trends 2019, Minority Rights p. 29 ([2019](https://minorityrights.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/2019_MR_Report_170x240_V7_WEB.pdf)). [↑](#endnote-ref-37)
38. Russia’s Natural Resources Ministry Calls for Urgent Action to Save Wild Reindeer, The Moscow Times ([Oct. 17, 2019](https://www.themoscowtimes.com/2019/10/17/russias-natural-resources-ministry-calls-for-urgent-action-to-save-wild-reindeer-a67765)). [↑](#endnote-ref-38)
39. Tatiana Vasilieva, If you’re left without reindeer, there is nothing else, Greenpeace ([Sept. 16, 2016](https://www.greenpeace.org/international/story/6972/if-youre-left-without-reindeer-there-is-nothing-else/)). [↑](#endnote-ref-39)
40. Greenpeace: New Russian Oil Depot Poses Anthrax Outbreak Risk, The Moscow Times ([Dec. 1, 2016](https://www.themoscowtimes.com/2016/12/01/new-russian-oil-depot-risks-anthrax-outbreak-greenpeace-says-a56385)). [↑](#endnote-ref-40)
41. Tatiana Vasilieva, If you’re left without reindeer, there is nothing else, Greenpeace ([Sept. 16, 2016](https://www.greenpeace.org/international/story/6972/if-youre-left-without-reindeer-there-is-nothing-else/)). [↑](#endnote-ref-41)
42. Indigenous peoples in Russia, IWGIA <https://www.iwgia.org/en/russia.html?start=6> [↑](#endnote-ref-42)
43. Minority and Indigenous Trends 2019, Minority Rights p. 31 ([2019](https://minorityrights.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/2019_MR_Report_170x240_V7_WEB.pdf)). [↑](#endnote-ref-43)
44. Id. at 135. [↑](#endnote-ref-44)
45. Id. at 1165. [↑](#endnote-ref-45)
46. Minority and Indigenous Trends 2019, Minority Rights p. 32 ([2019](https://minorityrights.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/2019_MR_Report_170x240_V7_WEB.pdf)). [↑](#endnote-ref-46)
47. Comply with the principle of free, prior and informed consent, CSIPN ([Oct. 26, 2020](http://www.csipn.ru/glavnaya/novosti-regionov/5254-soblyudat-printsip-svobodnogo-predvaritelnogo-i-osoznannogo-soglasiya#.X5jTV1NKhTY)). [↑](#endnote-ref-47)
48. https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2020-06-04/russia-declares-state-of-emergency-over-arctic-city-fuel-spill [↑](#endnote-ref-48)
49. https://thebarentsobserver.com/en/ecology/2020/08/russian-indigenous-peoples-call-elon-musk-not-buy-battery-metals-nornickel?fbclid=IwAR0lueyOU170dfumMgXszGj2pL34OjKb6FBH-803LPTtasnlCi4vm80oPvI [↑](#endnote-ref-49)
50. https://www.euronews.com/2019/08/23/india-russia-china-among-top-sulfur-dioxide-emitters-report [↑](#endnote-ref-50)
51. https://www.themoscowtimes.com/2020/06/29/explainer-russias-arctic-environmental-disasters-a70730 [↑](#endnote-ref-51)
52. Alex Levinson, FIELD UPDATE: If Russians Start Worrying About Coal…, Pacific Environment ([Sept. 12, 2016](https://www.pacificenvironment.org/field-update-if-russians-start-worrying-about-coal/)). [↑](#endnote-ref-52)
53. Indigenous Leader Fights to Save Her Ancestral Lands from Coal Devastation, Pacific Environment ([Dec. 16, 2016](https://www.pacificenvironment.org/indigenous-leader-fights-to-save-her-ancestral-lands-from-coal-devastation/)). [↑](#endnote-ref-53)
54. Russia: ‘People of the earth, do whatever you can to stop this genocide’, IWGIA ([Nov. 10, 2016](https://www.iwgia.org/en/russia/2463-russia-people-of-the-earth-do-whatever-you-can-to.html)). [↑](#endnote-ref-54)
55. Protecting Russian Rivers from Illegal Mining, Pacific Environment ([Dec. 21, 2016](https://www.pacificenvironment.org/protecting-russian-rivers-from-illegal-mining/)). [↑](#endnote-ref-55)
56. Dan Ferber, Research finds additional harm from coal dust exposure, Energy News Network ([Feb. 20, 2013](https://energynews.us/2013/02/20/midwest/research-finds-additional-harm-from-coal-dust-exposure/)). [↑](#endnote-ref-56)
57. NEWS FROM THE FIELD: The Birth of Russia’s Anti-Coal Movement, Pacific Environment ([Mar. 1, 2018](https://www.pacificenvironment.org/news-from-the-field-the-birth-of-russias-anti-coal-movement/)). [↑](#endnote-ref-57)
58. Communities Stand Up to Coal in Putin’s Russia, Pacific Environment ([Oct. 7, 2017](https://www.pacificenvironment.org/communities-stand-up-to-coal-in-putins-russia/)). [↑](#endnote-ref-58)
59. The Strategy for the Development of the Arctic Zone of Russia until 2035 was approved, CSIPN ([Oct. 27, 2020](http://www.csipn.ru/glavnaya/novosti-regionov/5257-utverzhdena-strategiya-razvitiya-arkticheskoj-zony-rossii-do-2035-goda#.X5jRllNKhTY)). [↑](#endnote-ref-59)
60. Russia pledges $3.6 Bln to Boost Arctic Foothold, The Moscow Times ([Feb. 27, 2017](https://www.themoscowtimes.com/2017/02/27/russia-pledges-36-bln-to-boost-arctic-economy-a57274)). [↑](#endnote-ref-60)
61. Reuters, ‘Russia Launches the First Ship in Its Powerful New Series of Nuclear Icebreakers’, Arctic Today, 28 May 2019, https://www.arctictoday.com/russia-launches-the-first-ship-in-itspowerful-new-series-of-nuclear-icebreakers/. [↑](#endnote-ref-61)
62. Sherri Goodman et al., ‘Inclusive Planning for Changing Arctic Futures: Demonstrating a Scenario-Based Discussion’ (Arctic Futures 2050 Conference, Washington, D.C., 2019), https:// councilonstrategicrisks.org/2019/09/19/planning-for-a-changing-arctic-a-scenario-baseddiscussion-paper/. [↑](#endnote-ref-62)
63. Kevin Harun, Big Decision on Toxic Oil to Keep Arctic Ocean Life Safe, Pacific Environment ([July 6, 2017](https://www.pacificenvironment.org/field-update-big-decision-toxic-oil-keep-arctic-ocean-life-safe/)). [↑](#endnote-ref-63)
64. Arctic Heavy Fuel Oil Ban Inches Forward, but loopholes denounced as “outrageous”, Pacific Environment ([Feb. 21, 2020](https://www.pacificenvironment.org/press-releases/arctic-heavy-fuel-oil-ban-inches-forward-but-loopholes-denounced-as-outrageous/)). [↑](#endnote-ref-64)
65. Sue Libenson, The True Cost of Oil Spills, Pacific Environment ([Feb. 9, 2017](https://www.pacificenvironment.org/true-cost-oil-spills/)). [↑](#endnote-ref-65)
66. Russian oil spill exposes history of Indigenous Peoples’ rights violations, IWGIA ([June 23, 2020](https://www.iwgia.org/en/russia/3789-russian-oil-spill-exposes-history-of-indigenous-peoples%E2%80%99-right-violations.html)). [↑](#endnote-ref-66)
67. Hobart M King, “Oil and Natural Gas Resources of the Arctic” https://geology.com/articles/arctic-oil-and-gas/ [↑](#endnote-ref-67)
68. Ariel Cohen, The Strategic Upside Behind Russia’s $55 Billion ‘Power of Siberia’ Pipeline To China, Forbes ([Dec. 6, 2019](https://www.forbes.com/sites/arielcohen/2019/12/06/is-there-strength-behind-russia-and-chinas-new-power-of-siberia-pipeline/?sh=2934c33d1faf)). [↑](#endnote-ref-68)
69. Id. [↑](#endnote-ref-69)
70. Marc Ozawa, Chi Kong Chyong, Kun-Chin Lin, Tim Reilly, Caroline Humphrey, Corine Wood-Donnelly, The Power of Siberia: A Eurasian Pipeline Policy ‘Good’ for Whom, Cambridge University Press 305, 327 ([June 2019](https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/in-search-of-good-energy-policy/power-of-siberia-a-eurasian-pipeline-policy-good-for-whom/7D8A68E4AFC9C6057AED3BCD02E77EE4)). [↑](#endnote-ref-70)
71. Stuart Elliott, Russia’s Gazprom mulls Power of Siberia capacity expansion to 44 Bcm/year, S&P Global ([June 26, 2020](https://www.spglobal.com/platts/en/market-insights/latest-news/natural-gas/062620-russias-gazprom-mulls-power-of-siberia-capacity-expansion-to-44-bcmyear)). [↑](#endnote-ref-71)
72. Elena Starostina, WWF DEMANDS PUBLIC ADMISSION TO THE OIL SPILL SITE IN KHABAROVSKY PROVINCE, [Dec 1 2020](https://wwf.ru/en/resources/news/amur/wwf-napravil-segodnya-zapros-v-rosneft-sakhalinmorneftegaz-na-dopusk-predstaviteley-ekologicheskikh-/)  [↑](#endnote-ref-72)
73. https://wwf.ru/en/resources/news/bioraznoobrazie/obshchestvenniki-podveli-itogi-letney-lososevoy-putiny-na-amure/ [↑](#endnote-ref-73)
74. https://wwf.ru/en/resources/news/amur/podvedeny-itogi-obshchestvennogo-monitoringa-i-kontrolya-vo-vremya-letnego-khoda-lososey-na-amure/ [↑](#endnote-ref-74)
75. https://www.themoscowtimes.com/2020/08/08/salmon-is-disappearing-from-russias-amur-river-its-taking-local-tradition-with-it-a71070 [↑](#endnote-ref-75)
76. Ibid. [↑](#endnote-ref-76)
77. Elena Bogdanova, Sergei Andronov, Andrey Lobanov, Ruslan Kochkin, Andrei Popov, Ildiko Asztalos Morell and JonØyvind Odland, Indigenous women’s reproductive health in the Arctic zone of Western Siberia: challenges and solutions, International Journal of Circumpolar Health, ([Nov, 20, 2020](https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/22423982.2020.1855913)). [↑](#endnote-ref-77)
78. Id. [↑](#endnote-ref-78)
79. Terry V. Callaghan, Olga Kulikova, Lidia Rakhmanova, Elmer Topp-Jorgensen, Niklas Labba, Lars-Anders Kuhmanen, Sergey Kirpotin, Olga Shaduyko, Henry Burgess, Arja Rautio, Ruth S. Hindshaw, Leonid L. Golubyatnikov, Gareth J. Marshall, Andrey Lobanov, Andrey Soromotin, Alexander Sokolov, Natalia Sokolova, Praskovia Filant, Margareta Johansson, Improving dialogue among researchers, local and indigenou peoples and decision-makers to address issues of climate change in the North, Springer Link 1161, 1167-1168 ([Nov. 12, 2019](https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s13280-019-01277-9)). [↑](#endnote-ref-79)
80. Id. at 1168. [↑](#endnote-ref-80)
81. Minority and Indigenous Trends 2019, Minority Rights p. 32 ([2019](https://minorityrights.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/2019_MR_Report_170x240_V7_WEB.pdf)). [↑](#endnote-ref-81)
82. Emily Couch, In Russia, women’s rights are still not human rights, International Observatory on Human Rights ([Dec. 9, 2019](https://observatoryihr.org/blog/in-russia-womens-rights-are-still-not-human-rights/)). [↑](#endnote-ref-82)
83. Terry V. Callaghan, Olga Kulikova, Lidia Rakhmanova, Elmer Topp-Jorgensen, Niklas Labba, Lars-Anders Kuhmanen, Sergey Kirpotin, Olga Shaduyko, Henry Burgess, Arja Rautio, Ruth S. Hindshaw, Leonid L. Golubyatnikov, Gareth J. Marshall, Andrey Lobanov, Andrey Soromotin, Alexander Sokolov, Natalia Sokolova, Praskovia Filant, Margareta Johansson, Improving dialogue among researchers, local and indigenou peoples and decision-makers to address issues of climate change in the North, Springer Link 1161, 1168 ([Nov. 12, 2019](https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s13280-019-01277-9)). [↑](#endnote-ref-83)
84. Anastasia Ultergasheva, *Indigenous Youth, Gender, and Domestic Violence in the Russian Sub-Arctic*, Gender Equality in the Arctic Phase 3 ([2020](https://arcticgenderequality.network/gea-times/2020/4/2/indigenous-youth-gender-and-domestic-violence-in-the-russian-sub-arctic)), [↑](#endnote-ref-84)
85. *Id.* [↑](#endnote-ref-85)
86. *Id.* [↑](#endnote-ref-86)
87. *Id.* [↑](#endnote-ref-87)
88. *Id.* [↑](#endnote-ref-88)
89. Chashchin V, Kovshov AA, Thomassen Y, et al. Health Risk Modifiers of Exposure to Persistent Pollutants among Indigenous Peoples of Chukotka. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*. 2019;17(1):128. Published 2019 Dec 23. doi:10.3390/ijerph17010128. [↑](#endnote-ref-89)
90. Jake Cordell. “Russia’s Excess Death Toll Hits 422K” [April 6 2021](https://www.themoscowtimes.com/2021/04/03/russias-excess-death-toll-hits-422k-a73462) [↑](#endnote-ref-90)
91. https://indigenous-russia.com/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/Aborigen-Forum-position-paper-on-COVID-19-1.pdf [↑](#endnote-ref-91)
92. Russia’s indigenous peoples are in the crosshairs of COVID-19, The San Francisco Times (Nov. 12, [2020](https://sftimes.com/russias-indigenous-peoples-are-in-the-crosshairs-of-covid-19/)). [↑](#endnote-ref-92)
93. Daria Khanolainen, Yulia Nesterova & Elena Semenova, *Indigenous education in Russia: opportunities for healing and revival of the Mari and Karelian Indigenous groups?*, Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education 6 (2020). [↑](#endnote-ref-93)
94. Id at 12. [↑](#endnote-ref-94)
95. Anastasia Ultergasheva, *Indigenous Youth, Gender, and Domestic Violence in the Russian Sub-Arctic*, Gender Equality in the Arctic Phase 3 (2020), https://arcticgenderequality.network/gea-times/2020/4/2/indigenous-youth-gender-and-domestic-violence-in-the-russian-sub-arctic (last visited Oct 28, 2020). [↑](#endnote-ref-95)
96. Id. [↑](#endnote-ref-96)
97. Id. [↑](#endnote-ref-97)
98. Varvara Korkina, Chapter 8: Indigenous Youth in Russia: Challenges and Opportunities, in Global Indigenous Youth 151 (Andrey Petrov tran., 2019), https://academiccommons.columbia.edu/doi/10.7916/d8-raaa-rd34 (last visited Nov 6, 2020). [↑](#endnote-ref-98)
99. Id at 152. [↑](#endnote-ref-99)
100. Jim Cummins (1989) Language and literacy acquisition in bilingual contexts, Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development, 10:1, 17-31 [↑](#endnote-ref-100)
101. Khanolainen, Daria; Nesterova, Yulia; Semenova, Elena (2020). Indigenous education in Russia : opportunities for healing and revival of the Mari and Karelian Indigenous groups?. Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, Early online. DOI: 10.1080/03057925.2020.1834350. [↑](#endnote-ref-101)
102. Id. [↑](#endnote-ref-102)
103. Id [↑](#endnote-ref-103)
104. Id [↑](#endnote-ref-104)