Sixty-ninth session
Item 67 (a) of the provisional agenda*
Elimination of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance: comprehensive implementation of and follow-up to the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action

Combating racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance and the comprehensive implementation of the follow-up to the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action

Note by the Secretary-General

The Secretary-General has the honour to transmit to the members of the General Assembly the report of the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, Mutuma Ruteere, prepared pursuant to General Assembly resolution 68/151.

* A/69/150.
Report of the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance

Summary

In the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action, particular attention is paid to concerns related to racism, racial hatred, xenophobia, racial discrimination and related intolerance, and a comprehensive framework provided for possible actions to combat such phenomena. In the present report, the Special Rapporteur focuses on the issue of racism and sports. Following a brief introduction (sect. I) and the overview of his activities carried out in the period since the issuance of his previous reports (sect. II), the Special Rapporteur refers in section III to racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance in sports, building upon the work initiated by his predecessors, and illustrates some manifestations of racism in team and individual sports. He then discusses the applicable legislation and standards at the international, regional and national levels, and presents some of the initiatives of sports federations and civil society that focus on preventing and combating racism in sports.
I. Introduction

1. The present report is submitted pursuant to General Assembly resolution 68/151, concerning global efforts for the total elimination of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance and the comprehensive implementation of and follow-up to the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action. In that resolution, the General Assembly encouraged the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, within his mandate, to continue focusing on the issues of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, which impede peaceful coexistence and harmony within societies.

2. In section II of the report, the Special Rapporteur refers to the activities he has undertaken since the submission of his previous reports to the General Assembly (A/68/329 and A/68/333).

3. In section III, the Special Rapporteur examines and discusses the phenomenon of racism, discrimination and other related intolerance in sports, building upon previous reports of his predecessors, illustrating some manifestations of racism in team and individual sports. He also discusses the applicable legislation and standards at the international, regional and national levels, and presents some key initiatives undertaken by numerous stakeholders, including sports federations and civil society, focused on preventing and combating racism in sports.

II. Activities of the Special Rapporteur

A. Country visits

4. The Special Rapporteur would like to thank the Government of the Republic of Korea, which has accepted his request for a visit from 29 September to 6 October 2014. The Special Rapporteur is awaiting confirmation of dates for a visit to Greece, which he hopes to undertake by early 2015. The Special Rapporteur is awaiting invitations to visit India, South Africa and Thailand. The Special Rapporteur also sent a request for a follow-up visit to Japan and a request for a visit to Fiji.

5. The Special Rapporteur visited Mauritania from 2 to 8 September 2013. He expresses his gratitude to the Government for its cooperation and openness in the preparation and conduct of his visit. The report on the visit was presented to the Human Rights Council at its twenty-sixth session (A/HRC/26/49/Add.1).

B. Other activities

6. The activities of the Special Rapporteur between July 2013 and March 2014 are reflected in his report to the Human Rights Council at its twenty-sixth session (A/HRC/26/49). Since March, the Special Rapporteur has participated in the third and final meeting of the Advisory Group on the Teaching Respect for All initiative, convened by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) in Paris, on 6 and 7 March. The Advisory Group reviewed the outcomes of several pilot projects conducted at the national level and validated the Teaching
Respect for All toolbox, an initiative undertaken by UNESCO to develop educational material that promotes non-discrimination and inclusion.

7. On 20 March, the Special Rapporteur held an exchange of views with representatives of the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance of the Council of Europe in Strasbourg, France, during which themes of common interest and possible areas of future cooperation were discussed.

8. On 16 June, the Special Rapporteur participated as a keynote speaker in a roundtable on racial/ethnic issues in police stop-and-search operations, organized in Berlin by the German Anti-Discrimination Agency as part of its activities for the Year against Racism, 2014.

9. The Special Rapporteur convened a side event on racism on the Internet and social media on the occasion of the presentation of his report to the Human Rights Council in Geneva on 26 June, with the participation of the Executive Secretary of the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance, the Vice Chair of the Federal Commission against Racism of Switzerland and a representative of the Association for Progressive Communications.

III. Racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance in sports

A. Context

10. The General Assembly, in its resolution 58/160, requested the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance to pay special attention to the increasing frequency of incidents of racism at various sporting events. Pursuant to that request, the former mandate holders examined the issue of racism in sports and, in their reports to the General Assembly, the Commission of Human Rights and the Human Rights Council, described the evolution of racist manifestations, racial hatred, xenophobia, racial discrimination and related intolerance in sports.

11. In his annual report to the General Assembly in 2003, the former Special Rapporteur Doudou Diène, warned about the recent increase of racist and xenophobic remarks coming from the stands at sporting events (see A/58/313, para. 26). Such incidents had been most common in European football, where players of African origin were greeted by spectators with monkey calls and racist insults, and bananas thrown in the stadium. Similar incidents had also been reported in tennis matches of major league tournaments (see A/58/313, paras. 27 and 28).

12. In his report to the General Assembly in 2004, the Special Rapporteur reiterated his earlier concerns (see A/59/329, sect. III.C). In 2005, he submitted two reports in which he addressed the issue of racism in sports: his annual report to the General Assembly (A/60/283, sect. III.B) and his annual report to the Commission on Human Rights (E/CN.4/2005/18, para. 48 (g)). In 2006, the Special Rapporteur again addressed the issue in his reports to the General Assembly (see A/61/335, paras. 37-40) and the Commission on Human Rights (E/CN.4/2006/16, sect. II.E). In 2007, he noted with concern that, in spite of the efforts made, racist violence in stadiums, more than ever, continued to be a serious phenomenon (A/HRC/4/19, para. 53); he reiterated the need to tie sanctions and penalties for all manifestations
and expressions of racism to an educational and cultural strategy and, in particular, to promoting the values of mutual respect and fair play over nationalism and commercialism that prevail in competitive sports (see A/62/306, para. 43).

13. In his interim report to the General Assembly in 2010, the newly appointed Special Rapporteur continued to address the issue of racism in sports, recalling that mass sports events offered valuable outreach platforms to mobilize people and convey crucial messages about equality and non-discrimination (A/65/295, para. 61). In 2012, the current mandate holder addressed the issue in his first report to the Human Rights Council (A/HRC/20/33, paras. 40-42). He recalled paragraph 86 of the Durban Programme of Action, which called upon States to counter ideologies that promoted racial hatred and racial discrimination, including by taking measures to combat the negative influence of such ideologies, especially on young people, through formal and non-formal education, the media and sport, as well as Human Rights Council resolution 13/27, entitled “A world of sports free from racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance”. He emphasized the importance of enhancing and establishing cooperation among States, intergovernmental organizations, international, regional and national sporting bodies and civil society to prevent racism, and recalled paragraph 218 of the Durban Programme of Action in which States were urged, in cooperation with such organizations and bodies, to intensify the fight against racism in sport by, among other things, educating the youth of the world through sport practised without discrimination of any kind and in the Olympic spirit, which requires human understanding, tolerance, fair play and solidarity. The Special Rapporteur expressed his continuing concern that, despite the immense potential of sport in promoting tolerance, racism in sport remained a serious problem. He noted that sport federations in some parts of the world had committed themselves to and often taken measures to punish and prevent racist incidents in sporting events, such as football, and proposed to bring attention to such good practices in a future report.

14. The Special Rapporteur would like to clarify that racism in sports is only one manifestation of discrimination and exclusion directed at persons and groups on the basis of their race, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation or other characteristics. Only by redressing the historical legacies and imbalances of racism and discrimination and by constructing tolerant and inclusive societies can the root causes of racism and intolerance in sports be addressed. In the present report, the Special Rapporteur builds on past efforts, including the efforts of his predecessor. The report examines the progress made with regard to legal standard setting at the international, regional and national levels and highlights some key positive initiatives undertaken by various stakeholders. The Special Rapporteur seeks to provide an overview of the remaining challenges and some good practices in the fight against racism and discrimination in sports and, to this end, is grateful for the insights gained from studies carried out by various international and national human rights institutions as well as reports of sports federations and national Governments.

B. Manifestations of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance in sports

15. Throughout history, team and individual competitions have been based on the principle of a level playing field, with individual and collective effort rather than
skin colour, ethnicity or religion as the basis for achievement. As such, sports have the capacity to demystify racial superiority discourses, making them an important and practical instrument for combating racism and proving that athletes succeed in sports independent of their skin colour. Such was the case with the 1936 Olympic Games in Berlin, in which the participation of athletes of multiracial backgrounds exposed the fallacies of racism and supposed-Aryan superiority promoted by the Nazi regime at the time. Furthermore, sports can be used as a positive symbol for social acceptance by conveying the image of multi-ethnic teams representing one nation and competing for a common goal.

16. Regrettably, modern sports continue to be afflicted by incidents and patterns of racial violence, racial insults and racial intolerance on the field and in arenas, as well as outside them. In recent times, not only have team events that appeal to large numbers of the public, such as football, rugby and basketball, been affected but individual professional sports, such as tennis and golf, have also been marred by racist acts (see A/58/313, paras. 27 and 28). The largest share of data and examples of racist action comes from Europe, mostly owing to the large number of human rights bodies and civil society organizations dedicated to cataloguing such incidents.

17. The Special Rapporteur notes that racist acts during sporting events are prevalent throughout the world. The most common are in the form of racist abuse aimed at players and supporters, as well as the display of racist banners and flags. In Europe, there have been many cases of bananas thrown at players of African descent during football matches in national leagues and regional competitions. Most recently, in 2014, a football player was the target of monkey calls and had a banana thrown at him during a match. Another football player had been the target of a similar incident during a Euro 2012 match. Racism by sports fans, however, is not confined to one region, and fans have been seen carrying banners and flags with far-right and ultra-nationalistic slogans and symbols in many parts of the globe. Recently, a football player was subjected to racial insults during the 2014 World Cup soccer tournament after having injured a player from the opposing team during a qualifying match.

18. Similarly, other sports have witnessed racist insults and attacks by fans. Serena and Venus Williams, both top-ranked tennis players in international tennis, have reported being subjected to racially motivated boos and cat-calls from spectators during tournaments. Jo-Wilfried Tsonga, another tennis player, reported that during his career he had received several letters containing racial abuse. In his autobiography, the former captain of the South African rugby team, Corné Krige,
criticized the lingering racism and referred to an incident during the 2003 Rugby World Cup in which a player had refused to share a room with a black teammate for racist reasons.

19. The Special Rapporteur observes that some representatives of sports federations, club officials and managers have trivialized racist chants from sports fans. Their usual interpretation of these events attributes racist utterances to rivalry and to emotions associated with competitive sporting events, and they tend to downplay them. For example, in November 2011, the President of the Federation for International Football Association (FIFA), Joseph Blatter, dismissed the existence of racism among football players; he referred to such incidents as “the game”, suggesting that racial comments by players were justified during a match. In April 2014, a national football team coach stated that there was no racism in football and that he chose to believe that a previous incident in his team was an isolated act. These kinds of statements serve to undermine the struggle against racism and xenophobia.

20. Racist comments by club officials and managers during sports events have also been reported. In May 2014, the owner of a United States basketball team reportedly made racial comments during a private phone conversation. The Special Rapporteur observes that racially motivated insults during matches and sports events are not exclusively spectator-related but also common practice among opposing athletes. On October 2011, player Luis Suarez was banned from stadiums for eight matches and fined £40,000 for racially abusing another player during an English Premier League match. In 2013, player Nicolas Anelka had his contract terminated for gross misconduct after he made a gesture regarded as anti-Semitic during an English Premier League match. Similarly, in 2013, Belgian player Omar Rahou was banned for 10 games with his national team from any competition organized by the Union of European Football Associations (UEFA), after he made the same gesture several times during a game. Many similar incidents of anti-Semitism and racism have been reported in football and other sports.

21. The Special Rapporteur would also like to address the issue of equal access by ethnic minorities to sports, including sports that are historically known as “white” or “elite”, such as cycling, tennis, golf, equestrian events and swimming. Wealth plays an important role in restricting access to certain sports and those in which participation requires higher incomes tend to reflect less diversity. In tennis, while players such as Serena and Venus Williams have been ranked as top international players for years, the number of black players in European and North American

---

13 See http://www.mirror.co.uk/sport/football/news/uefa-hand-futsal-player-omar-3206798#ixzz33rAlrA7B.
tennis federations has been disproportionate to their representation in those societies. Similarly, while Tiger Woods has been highly successful as a golfer from a racial minority, the composition of the top 50 players in 2014 is almost entirely white with very few representatives from minorities. Similarly, swimming, cycling and equestrian sports, all of which require high levels of income for entry, are characterized by less racial and ethnic diversity in national and international competitions.

22. Racial, ethnic and xenophobic prejudice underpins such utterances and practices, which are incompatible with the principles of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the various international conventions outlawing discrimination. The Special Rapporteur considers that eradicating racism from sports is an urgent concern that requires collective action by international organizations, international sports federations, national Governments, national sports federations and civil society.

23. The section below provides an overview of the existing legal framework and a compilation of some of the good practices initiated by several governmental and non-governmental bodies throughout the world in the fight against racism and related intolerance in sports.

C. Legal, policy and regulatory frameworks and measures taken at the international, regional and national levels by international organizations, governmental agencies, sports federations and civil society organizations

24. The Special Rapporteur observes that a fairly robust international legal framework already exists, as do a number of important emerging legal and policy initiatives implemented at the regional, national and local levels by Governments, international organizations, international sports federations, national sport federations and civil society organizations.

1. International frameworks and initiatives

25. Article 4 (a) of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination provides that States parties shall declare an offence punishable by law all dissemination of ideas based on racial superiority or hatred, as well as incitement to racial discrimination. Article 4 (b) provides that States parties shall declare illegal and prohibit organized and all other propaganda activities that promote and incite racial discrimination.

26. A number of United Nations human rights bodies have addressed the issue of racism, racial hatred, xenophobia, racial discrimination and related intolerance in sports. The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, in paragraph 2 (c) of its general recommendation No. 33 on the follow-up to the Durban Review Conference (CERD/C/GC/33), recommended that all international sporting bodies promote, through their national, regional and international federations, a world of sports free from racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance. In paragraph 7 of its general recommendation No. 35 on combating racist hate

15 See http://www.owgr.com/ranking.
speech (CERD/C/GC/35 and Corr. 1), the Committee stated that racist hate speech could take many forms and was not confined to explicitly racial remarks, and that speech attacking particular racial or ethnic groups might employ indirect language in order to disguise its targets and objectives. The Committee also recommended that States pay due attention to all manifestations of racist hate speech and take effective measures to combat them, including such non-verbal forms of expression as the display of racist symbols, images and behaviour at public gatherings, including sporting events. In paragraph 8 of the recommendation, the Committee considered that the importance of article 7 of the Convention had not diminished over time, noting that it highlighted the role of teaching, education, culture and information in the promotion of inter-ethnic understanding and tolerance.

27. In the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action of the World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance (A/CONF. 189/12 and Corr. 1, chap. I), several important areas of action to combat racism and related intolerance were highlighted, in particular the positive contribution of sport in the prevention of racism, violent nationalistic ideologies and xenophobic sentiments, particularly among young people. Recalling the Olympic spirit, with its emphasis on human understanding, tolerance, fair play and solidarity, States are urged in paragraphs 86 and 218 of the Programme of Action to implement legal sanctions in respect of incitement to racial hatred, in accordance with relevant international human rights law and in cooperation with intergovernmental organizations, the International Olympic Committee and international and regional sports federations, to intensify the fight against racism in sport. States are also encouraged to implement, in cooperation with relevant stakeholders, educational measures aimed at teaching youth the Olympic spirit through sports practised without discrimination.

28. The General Assembly has, on a regular basis, adopted resolutions addressing the global efforts aimed at the total elimination of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance and the comprehensive implementation of and follow up to the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action.16 In those resolutions, the General Assembly invited Member States to demonstrate greater commitment to fighting racism in sport by conducting educational and awareness-raising activities and by strongly condemning the perpetrators of racist incidents, in cooperation with national and international sports organizations. Furthermore, the Assembly expressed its concern at the increasing incidence of racism in various sporting events, while noting with appreciation the efforts undertaken by some governing bodies of the various sports federations to combat racism. In that regard, it invited all international sporting bodies to promote, through their national, regional and international federations, a world of sport free from racism and racial discrimination.

29. In particular, the General Assembly has called upon States to take advantage of mass sporting events as valuable outreach platforms for mobilizing people and conveying crucial messages about equality and non-discrimination and urged States, in cooperation with intergovernmental organizations, the International Olympic Committee and international and regional sports federations, to intensify the fight

against racism in sports by, among other things, educating the youth of the world through sport practised without discrimination of any kind and in the Olympic spirit (resolution 67/155, paras. 75 and 76).

30. The Intergovernmental Working Group on the Effective Implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action addressed the role of sport in combating racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance at its ninth session in 2012 (see A/HRC/19/77) and noted the potential of sport as a tool for the promotion of equality and diversity. The Working Group encouraged States, relevant stakeholders, in particular sport associations and committees, to ensure equality and non-discrimination based on combating racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance with regard to access to and use of sport facilities and services, job opportunities and career development (A/HRC/19/77, para. 111). The Working Group also noted the important role of sports players, sports authorities and other relevant bodies in contributing to awareness-raising campaigns on preventing and combating racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance and reinforcing the message for the elimination of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance (A/HRC/19/77, para. 115). It encouraged the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, the Special Adviser to the Secretary-General on Sport for Development and Peace and other relevant parts of the United Nations to engage with relevant international sporting bodies to discuss practical measures aimed at combating racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance in sport, such as the development and promotion of codes of conduct against racism in sport and of international standards and certificates (A/HRC/19/77, para. 120).

31. The United Nations Office on Sport for Development and Peace has also undertaken various initiatives to regulate and promote sport without discrimination.17 The Secretary-General’s Special Adviser on Sport for Development and Peace, Wilfried Lemke, launched in 2012 the youth leadership programme, an event whereby young people aged between 18 and 25 years receive practical and theoretical training from industry leaders on how to modify, improve and expand initiatives that support sport, peace and development.18 Recent events have been held in Germany, the Republic of Korea, Qatar and Switzerland with young people of several nationalities. The Special Adviser has, in partnership with the International Olympic Committee, organized the International Forum on Sport for Peace and Development with the view of solidifying the support of various stakeholders in the fields of sport and sport for development and peace.

32. The fundamental principles of the Olympic Charter, the core document of the Olympic Games, place sport at the service of the harmonious development of humankind and peaceful relations among nations, enshrining the values of human understanding, friendship, tolerance, fair play and solidarity, and combating any form of racial intolerance and discrimination.19 In accordance with the Code of

---

Ethics of the International Olympic Committee, safeguarding the dignity of the individual is a fundamental requirement of Olympism; there should be no discrimination between the participants on the basis of race, gender, ethnic origin, religion, philosophical or political opinion, marital status or any other grounds; and all forms of harassment of participants, be it physical or psychological, are prohibited.\(^{20}\)

33. The International Olympic Committee (IOC) supports this ideal through several thematic commissions. The Sport for All Commission promotes sport as a human right for all individuals, regardless of race, social class and gender.\(^{21}\) Each year, the Commission allocates IOC patronage and financial assistance to between 15 and 20 sport-for-all events in each of the five continents, the main selection criterion being that the event concerned must truly be open to all. Furthermore, the Commission supports International Olympic Day, which is celebrated throughout the world with inclusive sports activities that unite men, women and children of all ages.\(^{22}\) The Sport for All Commission also encourages the promotion of the World Conference on Sport for All, which is held every two years. Such events provide an ideal forum for exchanging ideas and experiences at an international level. At the most recent World Conference, held in Lima, the social benefits of sport, access to sport facilities and the role of civil society in sport were discussed.\(^{23}\)

34. The International Olympic Committee is also active with regard to women’s rights in sport. The Women and Sport Commission is a consultative body that supports the development and implementation of policies of gender equality at IOC.\(^{24}\) The Commission has undertaken several educational and training initiatives, such as seminars and workshops on women’s leadership in sports, and regional information seminars aimed at giving greater visibility to women and sport issues and to encourage National Olympic Committees to step up their work in this area. The Commission also undertook efforts to ensure that women benefit from equal opportunity in the scholarships offered by IOC.\(^{25}\) Furthermore, IOC supports the World Conference on Women and Sports, which is held every four years. The purpose of the Conference is to assess the progress made within the Olympic movement and to define future priority actions to improve and increase the involvement of women and girls in sports. Discussed at the most recent Conference, held in Los Angeles, United States of America, in 2012, was the need for women and men to work together to break down barriers and overcome obstacles to further progress; it was stressed that gender equality in sport could only be achieved through collaboration and partnerships with all relevant stakeholders.\(^{26}\) Other IOC bodies, such as the International Relations Commission, the Commission for Culture and Olympic Education, the International Olympic Truce Foundation and the Sport and Environment Commission, also support the ideals of Olympism through


educational and awareness-raising activities in the areas of development, peace and environment.27

35. The Federation for International Football Association (FIFA) has been a long-standing and active player in the fight against racism in international football and has instituted a series of symbolic actions to teach fair play and respect for diversity of both athletes and supporters.28 The FIFA anti-discrimination day is a special pre-match event, initiated in 2002 during the semi-finals of the World Cup in the Republic of Korea and Japan, which now takes place annually at one of the FIFA competitions to raise awareness of the need to abolish racism and other forms of discrimination throughout the world. Prior to the match, the captains of both teams read out a declaration against discrimination, following which both teams come together in the centre of the stadium and hold a banner with slogans against racism. Another initiative, the “Say No to Racism” campaign sponsored by FIFA, began with the 2006 World Cup and expanded upon the FIFA anti-racism day, making it customary to prominently display large “Say no to racism” banners prior to official FIFA matches. Furthermore, as part of the campaign, FIFA publishes on its official website interviews with players, coaches, representatives of clubs and federations and other relevant stakeholders concerning the issue of racism in sport, thereby multiplying and empowering voices against racism.

36. The sixty-third FIFA Congress, held in 2013, unanimously adopted a resolution on the fight against racism and discrimination,29 in which the range of sanctions for racism and the personalities legally subject to them was expanded. Sanctions may be imposed on players, officials and spectators, the staff of clubs and associations, and the clubs and associations themselves. The document foresees a large number of sanctions, such as fines, match suspensions, stadium bans, deductions of points, relegation to a lower division, closed matches, forfeit of matches, and disqualification from competition. As far as the fines are concerned, various minimum amounts are established in order to reflect the severity of the infringements. The sanctions are mandatory for all member associations and must be implemented, without exception, in local and regional competitions in accordance with their internal association structure.

37. For the 2014 World Cup in Brazil, the Brazilian Government, in tandem with FIFA, prepared the campaign entitled “Copa sem Racismo” (World Cup without Racism).30 Several media broadcasts were prepared to raise awareness that racism and related intolerance is an unacceptable crime. The campaign was broadcasted on popular news websites in Brazil and the official websites of the Government and public agencies. Pursuing the objective of no racist incidents at the World Cup, social media and the hashtag #copasemracismo were used to encourage the population to adhere to the campaign, and a series of videos promoting a World Cup without racism were exhibited during the lead-up. Furthermore, in both the semi-finals and the final, players entered stadiums carrying banners and posters with anti-racist slogans.

Regional frameworks and initiatives

38. The Special Rapporteur appreciates the extensive work of regional organizations in combating racism and related intolerance, and welcomes the development of groundbreaking frameworks to fight racism at sporting events, as well as specific initiatives aimed at educating stakeholders and raising awareness of the issue.

39. The Special Rapporteur was made aware of the Media against Racism in Sport programme, a joint programme of the European Union and the Council of Europe. Having recognized that media coverage of sport did not always reflect social and cultural diversity, the programme is aimed at including diversity and non-discrimination in media production and content design. In order to enhance the capacities of media professionals to develop an inclusive approach to media production, the programme’s online resource centre hosts the European contact database, which contains information on more than 450 media professionals in various parts of Europe. Furthermore, the resource centre provides virtual material on several topics of diversity and non-discrimination, including practical examples of media production, journalism, media training, media literacy education and editorial management.

40. The European Parliament in 2006 adopted the Declaration on tackling racism in football, with the support of its 423 members. In the Declaration, the European Parliament recognized the serious incidents of racism that had occurred in football matches across Europe, noting that football players, like other workers, had the right to a racism-free working environment, as set down in the case law of the Court of Justice of the European Communities. Pursuant to article 13 of the Treaty establishing the European Community, the European Parliament, in paragraph 1 of the Declaration, strongly condemned all forms of racism at football matches, both on and off the field. It also noted that the popularity of football offered a new and continuous opportunity to tackle racism and, in paragraphs 3 and 4, called on national football associations, leagues, clubs, players’ unions and supporters’ groups to apply UEFA best practice, such as its 10-point plan of action, and for those with a high profile in football to speak out regularly against racism. In paragraphs 5 and 6, the European Parliament encouraged UEFA and all other competition organizers in Europe to consider imposing sanctions on national football associations and clubs whose supporters or players commit racist offences, including removal of persistent offenders from their competitions, and to ensure that referees have the option of stopping or abandoning matches in the event of serious racist abuse.

41. The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance, a subsidiary body of the Council of Europe, adopted in 2008 general policy recommendation No. 12, which is focused on combating racism and racial discrimination in sports. The document contains an extensive and inclusive set of recommendations on policies to combat racism and racial discrimination in sport, to be instituted at the national level by States members of the Council of Europe. Members are encouraged, inter alia, to create national mechanisms to record racist incidents in sporting events and

ensure that legislation aimed at preventing and sanctioning racist offences in sports is effectively implemented. With regard to educational measures, it is recommended that member States promote cooperation among all relevant stakeholders, namely police, sports clubs, the media, sponsors and supporters’ organizations, and with these actors, build national coalitions against racism in sport.

42. The European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, an agency founded to provide expert advice on human rights issues and policy to the institutions of the European Union and its member States, implemented an extensive research programme on racism and related intolerance in Europe, having published a comparative report on the situation of racism, ethnic discrimination and exclusion of migrants and minorities in sports in its member States in 2010. Among the suggestions put forward in the report are the strengthening of the European framework in the prevention of racist incidents in sports; educational and awareness-raising activities, in close cooperation with relevant stakeholders; and, in particular, initiatives aimed at increasing the participation in sports of women and girls from ethnic minorities. Furthermore, national and local authorities are encouraged to develop effective monitoring systems for racist incidents, and to maximize the potential role of national human rights institutions in providing support to victims. Highlighted in the report is the need for sports governing bodies to implement effective anti-racist measures in accordance with the human rights framework developed by the European Union.

43. The Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) addressed the issue of racism in sport in 2012 when, in April, the Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights organized the Supplementary Human Dimension Meeting on Combating Racism, Intolerance and Discrimination in Society through Sport in Vienna. As described in its report, participants in the meeting, which was attended by representatives of member States, international organizations and civil society, discussed the contemporary manifestations of racism, intolerance and discrimination, the monitoring and response mechanisms available at the national and international levels to prevent racist incidents, and the role of sport in the promotion of integration and equality in society. OSCE recommended that participating States encourage partnerships between national and local authorities and civil society to tackle discrimination. It also recommended that participating States increase financial support for programmes, including in sports, which foster diversity and combat discrimination.

44. The African Union has undertaken initiatives to reform and improve its mechanisms for enhancing the positive social impact of sports activities in Africa. Following the dissolution of the Supreme Council for Sports in Africa in 2012, the Executive Council of the African Union established a new architecture for sports to promote sport as a fundamental right to be enjoyed by all, and to ensure the discussion of such key issues as social development through sport and the participation of women in sports. The issue of racism in sports was also addressed.

during the fifth session of the African Union Conference of Ministers of Sport, held in Abidjan from 22 to 26 July 2013. The African Union Commissioner for Social Affairs, Mustapha Kaloko, referred to sport as a tool for decolonization and liberation of the continent, as well as in the fight against apartheid and all forms of racial discrimination and intolerance. He emphasized that sport had been used to support development efforts throughout the world, and that Africa should invest in sports for its potential contribution to the development and renaissance of the continent.\textsuperscript{37}

45. With regard to regional sports federations, UEFA, in partnership with the Football against Racism in Europe (FARE) network, issued in 2003 a guide to good practice for combating racism in European football.\textsuperscript{38} The guide is a comprehensive document which defines and identifies sources of racism in European football. It contains a summary of actions taken at the national level by some football federations and, most important, various initiatives that can be taken at the club level to combat racism. Among the initiatives prescribed, UEFA recommends that clubs be transparent, inform their supporters of its position against racism and encourage them to join the club in this effort. It also encourages clubs to prevent the sale of racist literature inside and around the stadium, to remove all racist graffiti from the ground, and to take disciplinary action against any player who engages in racial abuse.

46. In the guide, UEFA encourages all national federations to follow the German and Norwegian football federations, which developed their own plans of action to combat racism in their leagues, including the creation of national and independent campaigns and educational programmes. In 2006, UEFA toughened its disciplinary rules relating to racism and intolerance. Since then, players involved in racist incidents have been liable to suspension for up to 10 games. Moreover, racist remarks by supporters may lead to sanctions at the club level in the form of partial stadium closure for a first offence,\textsuperscript{39} and complete closure for a repeated offence. In 2009, UEFA took another step in the fight against racism by giving referees the power to suspend a match for 10 minutes in cases of racism from the stands, and to end it in the event the infraction did not stop.\textsuperscript{40}

3. National frameworks and initiatives

47. The Special Rapporteur wishes to highlight several positive initiatives taken by Governments and national sports federations to strengthen the national framework to combat racism and racial discrimination in sports, which have been brought to his attention. The examples are in no way exhaustive and the Special Rapporteur encourages all stakeholders to continue providing information in this regard.


\textsuperscript{40} See http://news.bbc.co.uk/sport2/hi/football/8131082.stm.
48. The Government of Australia has incorporated into the national framework, under the Racial Discriminations Act of 1975, the provisions of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination. As indicated in a report issued by the Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission, racial discrimination legislation in Australia aims to ensure that people are treated equally, regardless of their race, colour, national and ethnic origin, descent, ethnic or ethno-religious background, including in sporting activities, and sports organizations may be held liable if persons representing the them, such as coaches, board members, managers or officials, behave unlawfully in the course of their duties.\footnote{41} According to the report, there has been a considerable reduction in overt racist behaviour owing in part to the development of strong social norms against openly expressing racist views.\footnote{42}

49. The Australian Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission is responsible for investigating alleged infringements under national law, and has developed several awareness-raising initiatives in recent years to combat the pernicious effects of racism in society, including in sports activities. The campaign entitled “Racism: It Stops with Me”,\footnote{43} which is part of the national anti-racism strategy, promotes a clear understanding in the Australian community of what racism is, and how it can be prevented and combated. Australians are invited to reflect upon their own racist attitudes and to transform their behaviour. The campaign features sports personalities in pictures and short videos expressing the motto of the campaign, stimulating the public to do the same. The campaign has been supported by various national sports federations, such as the cricket federation, the football federation and the Australian Olympic Committee, as well as other national organizations, private companies and individuals in Australia.\footnote{43}

50. In the United States of America, the Patsy Mink Equal Opportunity in Education Federal Act of 1972 (Public Law No. 92-318 (23 June 1972)), which complements the Civil Rights Act of 1964 in the area of public education and federally assisted programmes, was enacted to end discrimination in various fields based on religion, race, colour or national origin; it effectively ensures that all athletes receive equivalent treatment, benefits, and opportunities in any sport financed by the Federal Government. Under the Act, an evaluation is made as to whether federally financed sports effectively comply with the equal opportunities policies based on practical grounds, such as equality in the provision of equipment and supplies; equality in scheduling of games and practice time; equality in travel and per diem allowance; equality of opportunity to receive coaching and academic tutoring; equality in the assignment and compensation of coaches and tutors; equality in the provision of locker rooms, practice and competitive facilities; equality in the provision of medical and training facilities and services; equality in provision of housing, dining facilities and services; and equality in publicity. As such, the Patsy Mink Act has been ground-breaking legislation that ensures equal access to sports for programmes that receive federal funding.\footnote{44}


\footnote{42} Ibid.


51. The Special Rapporteur also welcomes the good practices and initiatives of national sports federations to prevent racism in their area of concern. In the United States of America, the Rooney Rule was established by the National Football League in 2003 to foster diversity at the management level of professional American football.45 The rule was established to ensure that minority coaches, particularly African Americans but also other ethnic minorities, are considered for high-level coaching positions by requiring clubs to interview at least one candidate with a minority background during the process of replacing head coaches. Before the rule went into effect, the League had had only six minority coaches in more than 80 years of existence. Since the rule has been put into practice, 12 have been hired.46 As of 2009, the Rooney Rule requirements apply to all vacancies for senior positions in American football operations within the National Football League.47

52. The Special Rapporteur also notes the recent measures taken by the Brazilian Football Federation to prevent racism in football games and increase the awareness of and social acceptance for all on the field and in the stands. On April 2014, the Federation launched its campaign entitled “Somos Todos Iguais” (We Are All Equal), comprising a series of actions to be taken on and off the field.48 A smartphone application was developed to enable supporters who witnessed any act of discrimination to forward their complaints to the authorities during a match.49 The application also features videos and texts by Brazilian athletes and sports journalists speaking up against racism and encouraging fans to do the same. With a focus on social media, supporters are encouraged to take pictures of themselves with special sports gear which is distributed prior to the game and displays anti-racist slogans. Prior to every game, the announcer briefly reads out the ethics of the campaign, while banners with anti-racist slogans are placed around the stadium.

53. The Royal Netherlands Football Association initiated the “Football for everyone” initiative, an action plan to foster acceptance in national league clubs.50 Following research which had found that most clubs did not have specific policies for the integration of players from minority communities, the Association compiled an 11-point action plan as a first step to counter racism, discrimination and homophobia in the game. The action plan has a strong formal education emphasis; as such, the Association revised its training material and expanded the criteria for the certification of youth, amateur and professional training courses to include education on discrimination and sexual orientation. Incorporated in the action plan is an innovative measure whereby several feedback mechanisms have been created at the national level to ensure that the policies implemented are effective on the ground. For instance, the Association created confidential advisers in its district offices with a twofold objective: to act as an advisory body for clubs, providing technical assistance in project implementation; and to act as a sounding board for support.

the implementation of the action plan, providing feedback to the Association’s policymakers. In addition, the Association joined efforts with the Fair Play Alliance to conduct independent research on the evolution of discrimination in Netherlands football, monitoring the impact and evolution of the initiatives undertaken. Another aim of the action plan is to expand and improve existing campaigns in sports, such as the “Towards a safer sports climate” initiative, which incorporates the issue of discrimination in its informative activities and workshops.51

54. The National Hockey League (NHL), composed of United States and Canadian teams in North America, initiated its Diversity project which provides the opportunity for young people to experience the game of hockey, irrespective of cultural, economic or racial background.52 Among its other activities, the Willie O’Ree All-Star Game is an annual celebration of the multicultural heritage of the League, with boys and girls representing NHL diversity programmes from across North America interacting with NHL players and attending an NHL game.53

D. Civil society initiatives to counter racism, xenophobia, discrimination and other related hate speech in amateur and professional sports

55. The Special Rapporteur wishes to highlight a number of positive initiatives undertaken by civil society organizations in raising awareness of racism and discrimination in sports, and in combating such forms of intolerance.

56. Football against Racism in Europe (FARE),54 created in 1996, is a network of non-governmental organizations, amateur groups and supporter clubs in Europe, Africa and the Americas, and is committed to combating discrimination in football. The network works to advance the social inclusion of marginalized and disenfranchised groups and to engage policymakers, key players and governing bodies in the anti-discrimination movement. The “Football People Action Week” is an annual international campaign organized locally by members of the FARE network. It was developed to increase public awareness of discrimination in football, create a united front by bringing together all of football’s stakeholders, and develop ideas and new practices that challenge exclusion.55 The FARE network also supports Mondiali Antirazzisti (Anti-racist World Cup), a non-competitive international championship held every year in Italy and attended by teams and organizations from several countries.56

57. The Special Rapporteur was also made aware of the efforts initiated by the United Kingdom-based educational charity, Show Racism the Red Card, established in January 1996.57 The charity presents an anti-racist message to youth by developing activities that encourage them to challenge racism in daily life. Among its several initiatives, it spreads messages by attaching anti-racist phrases to the image of well-known athletes and sports personalities in media campaigns. The

charity also holds workshops for players, coaches and referees to educate them on how to deal with racism on the field and in stands, using real-life scenarios taken from practical experience. The workshops explore the responses of the stakeholders in such situations with a view to controlling and minimizing racist incidents.

58. Similarly, the Never Again Association aims to raise awareness of the issue of racism and xenophobia, and to build a broad and inclusive movement against racism and discrimination in Poland. In partnership with UEFA, the Association has implemented several educational and awareness-raising activities during regional football championships in Poland and Ukraine. In addition, in cooperation with UEFA and the Football against Racism in Europe (FARE) network, the Association has set up the East Europe Monitoring Centre to collect data on racist incidents that occur during football matches in the region.

59. The Special Rapporteur was also informed of the initiatives undertaken by the International League against Racism and Anti-Semitism, based in France, which has partnered with football clubs in the first and second divisions of the French football league to run anti-discrimination activities. The League has developed and produced a mobile application that allows supporters to identify and denounce racist or anti-Semitic acts during football games. It also provides support to youth tournaments that combine sports activities with seminars and workshops on racism.

IV. Conclusions and recommendations

60. The Special Rapporteur welcomes the numerous initiatives and frameworks adopted by international and regional organizations and sports federations, national sports federations, Governments and civil society to prevent and combat racism, racial hatred, xenophobia, racial discrimination and related intolerance in sports. Notwithstanding the progress made by the initiatives undertaken at several levels, racism in sports has proved to be a resilient and complex problem with different manifestations. Racism and discrimination in sports go beyond utterances, and include discrimination in access to sports by racial and ethnic groups. In this respect, the Special Rapporteur recommends to all stakeholders that they continue to support existing initiatives while creating environments that foster the debate on racism and intolerance, and continue to raise awareness of existing patterns of discrimination. It is important that all stakeholders integrate their efforts to expand these positive initiatives so as to counterbalance the pernicious effects of racism and discrimination in sports.

61. The Special Rapporteur recalls general recommendation No. 35 of the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, in which the Committee highlighted the role of teaching, education, culture and information in the promotion of inter-ethnic understanding and tolerance, guaranteed under article 7 of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (CERD/C/GC/35 and Corr. 1, para. 30). In this regard, the Special Rapporteur refers to his report on the role of education in preventing racism (A/HRC/23/56) and reaffirms that education continues to be an effective antidote to deep-rooted racism and discrimination, including its manifestations in sports. The Special Rapporteur also refers to the resolutions adopted by the General Assembly, in which the potential of sport is recognized as a universal language contributing to the education of people on the values of diversity, tolerance and fairness and as a means to combat racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, and encourages States to use the unique educational potential of sports to combat manifestations of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance.

62. The Special Rapporteur expresses concern that national legislation and legal frameworks in some States do not provide sanctions for the propagators of racism and discrimination at sporting events. The Special Rapporteur encourages all States to incorporate into their national legislation international and regional norms and standards in order to appropriately and effectively strengthen their domestic system to prevent and combat racism and discrimination in sports.

63. The economic primacy of football over other sports in certain parts of the world, particularly in Europe, as well as the wide media coverage enjoyed by football overall, seems to have placed this particular sport in a spotlight in the debate on racism and discrimination in sports. As such, many of the legal frameworks and policies discussed in the present report have been initiated by football sports federations. In this regard, the Special Rapporteur expresses concern that measures for the prevention of racism, racial hatred, xenophobia or any other form of discrimination are not as equally developed in other sports. Successful practices and policies should be extended to all sports, individual and team, including those with less economic power and visibility in the media. The Special Rapporteur is also concerned that while racial and religious discrimination is condemned in the regulations of many sports federations, there are no established comprehensive disciplinary mechanisms and enforceable measures to prevent and sanction acts of racism and related intolerance in their activities. International, regional and national sports federations are encouraged to review and expand their practices with regard to combating racism and discrimination, in particular those related to education of athletes and supporters.

64. The Special Rapporteur is of the opinion that policies and initiatives to combat racism and discrimination are more effective when combined with reliable data about the occurrence, location and content of such incidents. As such, he encourages States to implement reliable and accessible monitoring systems for the cataloguing of racist, homophobic, sexist and other related incidents in sports.
65. Furthermore, the Special Rapporteur reminds States of the previous recommendations of former mandate holders, in particular those concerning the need to demonstrate greater commitment in fighting racism in sport; adopt preventative, educational and awareness-raising measures; and condemn the perpetrators of racist incidents, in cooperation with national, regional and international sports organizations.

66. Finally, in view of the continued phenomenon and manifestations of racism in sports, international and regional organizations as well as international, regional and national sports bodies need to continue their collaboration. The Special Rapporteur considers that sports authorities and associations should be inspired by some of the positive initiatives highlighted in the present report and draw upon these good practices to develop their own frameworks or action plans to fight against racism and other forms of discrimination in their respective sports.