## Citizens Against Hate – India <u>http://citizensagainsthate.org/</u>

# Submission to SR on Freedom of Religion or Belief on his report on anti-Muslim Hatred and Discrimination to the 46<sup>th</sup> session of the Human Rights Council

Citizens Against Hate welcomes the opportunity to share information with the Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Religion or Brief for his forthcoming report on anti-Muslim Hatred and Discrimination to the 46<sup>th</sup> Human Rights Council. This submission relates to the specific context of manifestations of intolerance, hatred, and discrimination against Muslims in India – a minority group that makes up over 14 % of the India's population, totalling some 200 million persons.

## 1. Preface

Islamophobia and Anti-Muslim hatred have deep roots in India, although these are beginning to be acknowledged as such only recently. The dominant discourse in colonial and post-colonial India has been of Muslims continually signalled as not being indigenous – though the first Muslim communities are reported from the  $6^{th}$  century AD. The official and constitutional discourse in post-partition India strove hard to adopt the language of accommodation and India was represented as being secular, however the constitution remained inconsistent as it offered some cultural rights to minorities (including Muslims), but withheld affirmative action from them on the same grounds.<sup>1</sup>

During colonial times, intercommunity relationship between Hindus (principal majority, 82% of population) and Muslims (biggest minority) were marked by intermittent violent flare ups, termed communal riots or communal violence. The partition of India was also accompanied by mass migrations of Hindus and Muslims across borders and horrific violence by both communities. Despite the creation of Pakistan, many Muslims in other parts of India chose not to migrate. These numbers were not small by any standards but they were now reduced to a suspect minority that is a target of communalism - which is a catch all phrase for Muslim prejudices, systemic discrimination, policy 'neglect' and political tokenism. Communal violence however continued to be discussed as if the violence was still clashes between equals. The reality however is that in post-independent India Muslims have been targeted violently in instances of mass violence in which the perpetrators often enjoy impunity. The impunity was operationalized through complicity of police, lack of investigation, and the flouting of due procedure, which altogether resulted in failure to prosecute the culprits. Muslims are thus forced to share blame for violence against in called Hindu-Muslim riots which are essentially anti-Muslim violence.<sup>2</sup>

Still, until 1990s these episodes of 'communal violence' were seen as aberrations. Although there was a subtle anti-Muslim communalism (Islamophobia) always lurking in Indian polity and everyday experiences, blatant Islamophobia and anti-Muslim hate speeches were not a

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Indian Secularism and its critics: Some reflections. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/1408550</u>
<sup>2</sup> KN Pannikar, Minorities in South Asia.

http://www.sacw.net/DC/CommunalismCollection/ArticlesArchive/knp15102005.html

norm. This was largely because so far, political parties and coalitions in power were of parties which maintained secularism as part of their stated ideology. This changed when the Bharatiya Janata Party (BJP), seen as the electoral front of the 'Sangh Parivar' comprising several Hindu Nationalist outfits, rose to political ascendance. Their political Ideology or 'Hindutva' at best envisions India as a homeland exclusively for Hindus in which other religious communities can only have second class citizenship. At its worst the ideology is genocidal and particularly offensive to the Muslims. Since 2014, when the BJP made a government which absolute majority in the Indian Parliament, it has sought to centralise and capture all institutional and state power in aid of its political project.

## 2. Discrimination in law and practice

This has meant that the discrimination against Muslims has intensified and achieved unprecedented proportions. This is especially visible in legislative business of government as well as its law enforcement. In the following sections some of the specific and more recent instances of anti-Muslim discrimination have been mentioned. We first catalogue discriminatory laws and follow that with how law enforcement discriminates.

## Discriminatory laws

2.1 Cow protection laws

One of these provisions is ostensibly related to scientific management of cattle commonly called cow protection. Most states in India (24 of total 29) ruled ever by the BJP now have laws that ban slaughter of cows and criminalise sale of beef. Under the ruse of these laws, Muslims who trade in cattle and beef have been the target of vigilante violence and lynchings leading to numerous deaths.<sup>3</sup> The laws themselves create conditions of nexus between police and vigilante groups. Policing of even other cattle such as buffalos and routine labelling of any kind of meat as beef under the ruse of cow protection, is a political ploy to mobilise anti-Muslim (also occasionally anti-lower caste) sentiments in a society where upper caste Hindus consider cows holy animal.<sup>4</sup>

## 2.2 Religious conversion

Then there are laws against religious conversion - perhaps the most blatant subversion of a clear provision in the Indian Constitution. Enacted by several state legislatures (7 of the 29 states), these regulate religious conversions under misleading titles such as 'Protection of Freedom of religion' act. The first of these state laws sought to deter 'lower caste' groups from converting to Christianity and Islam under the ruse of preventing coercion and 'inducement'. The laws are used to criminalise the practice and propagation of religion by minorities, a fundamental right available to all citizens in India.

2.3 Inter religious marriage

Now laws are being enacted - or amended - to proscribe conversion for marriage. They allow for state to regulate choice and love in marriages, something that the existing Special

https://www.hrw.org/report/2019/02/18/violent-cow-protection-india/vigilante-groups-attack-minorities <sup>4</sup> Cow Slaughter Prevention Laws in India: How the law not just protect cow vigilantes, but sanctifies lynchings.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Human Rights Watch, Violent Cow Protection in India. 2019.

<sup>.</sup> https://cjp.org.in/cow-slaughter-prevention-laws-in-india/

Marriage Act allows for interfaith marriages of individuals who do not wish to subscribe to either of their communities' personal laws. Typically, the penalties are harsher for women allowing for Hindutva Vigilante groups to raise the bogey of a large-scale conspiracy of Muslims men coercing Hindu women to convert to Islam for marriages, terming it 'love jihad' an Islamophobic labelling. <sup>5</sup>

## 2.4 Residential segregation

Law is also being put to Hindutva project of segregating communities – such as with Gujarat's Disturbed Areas Act in 1991 wherein transfer of property in areas designated as disturbed areas cannot be done without express approval of district authorities. While the stated intent is protection of tenants from forced evictions, the state use this law to enforce communal segregation (between Hindus and Muslims) barring transfer of property from otherwise *bona fide* buyers and sellers if they happen to belong to different communities. <sup>6</sup>

## 2.5 Exclusion from social protection

Government published data (Sachar Commission Report, 2006) confirms that Muslims, among all religious minorities in India, especially suffer structural discrimination in economic and political representation, access to opportunities, and life and security. Nation-wide, Muslims are over-represented among the marginalised in India. The poorest Muslims suffer the worst forms of exclusion – education, health, income and employment, as well as access to services. A recent report claims that inter-generational mobility (a proxy for equality of opportunity) has been steadily declining among Muslims, even though it has been rising for the rest of India, including for its traditionally excluded – Dalits.<sup>7</sup> Muslim representation in politics, public service, media, education and formal employment is dismal, being much below par.<sup>8</sup> Yet, Muslims are discriminated against by expressly being excluded from the protections like quotas in jobs and higher educational institutions similar to those offered to other minorities and marginalised groups such as the SC/ST<sup>9</sup> and economic benefits (tax exemptions) offered to members of Hindu Undivided Family<sup>10</sup>. The former discrimination is built into the Constitutional (SC) Order, 1950.

#### 2.6 Extraordinary laws

India has several laws for the stated aim of preservation and protection of 'public order', 'security of the state', and 'national security'. The laws have sweeping and extraordinary provisions for preventive detention, confessional statements as evidence, long incarceration without bail pending trial and weak or no redressal for the wrongfully accused. In most of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Are Anti-conversion laws being repackaged as Love Jihad laws? The Quint.

https://www.thequint.com/news/law/love-jihad-laws-but-india-already-has-anti-conversion-laws-explained <sup>6</sup> The Gujarat Government is enforcing communal segregation and criminalising property transfers. The Caravan. <u>https://caravanmagazine.in/policy/the-gujarat-state-is-enforcing-communal-segregation-andcriminalising-property-transfers</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Asher, S., Novosad, P. and Rifkin, C. (2018). Intergenerational mobility in India: Estimates from new methods and administrative data, September 2018. World Bank.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> 4 <u>https://rajatdutta13.blogspot.com/2020/05/muslim-representation-in-governing-body.html?m=1</u>
<sup>9</sup> Fazal, 2017. Scheduled Caste, Reservation and Religions: Revisiting a Juridical debate.

https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0069966716680429?casa\_token=yY17A1Z2D7cAAAAA%3Ar5C ExcHpvClXDqlC3aztygK5XqqG54wT59RSGXBVWLHpuKBl8M16Rji-uz9UubXDmaB6A-COCtrqqgg&

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Gupta & Gupta, 2017. The Hindu Undivided Family in Independent India's corporate governance and tax regime. <u>https://journals.openedition.org/samaj/4300</u>

these cases the offence is widely and vaguely defined, and the burden of proof is excessively on the accused to prove that they are innocent. These are being expanded. In 2019, BJP government amended India's principal anti-terror law, by bringing in Unlawful Activities (Prevention) Amendment (UAPA) Act 2019, which makes it possible for the state to declare individuals as terrorists before they have ever been convicted of a crime. A disproportionately large number of those charged under crimes in these laws are Muslim. And owing to their economic and social vulnerabilities, Muslims form a disproportionately large section of the incarcerated population, generally.<sup>11</sup> This is an accepted indicator of discrimination in the legal system and the problems related to access to justice.

Since returning to power in May 2019 with an even bigger majority, the ruling BJP has implemented a programme of relentless targeting of Muslims – in law and through use of force, against people dissenting against discrimination.

#### 2.7 Triple Talaq

Muslim Women (Protection of Rights on Marriage) Act was passed in July 2019 which rendered three talaqs (literally divorce) given in one sitting as illegal. Not only that a final divorce would not be affected in this manner, but the utterance was also criminalised with penalty of a jail term of up to three years. This bill was seen as a legal aggression against Muslim men who are also target of vigilante and state violence.<sup>12</sup> Further it was also seen as another step towards tempering with the Muslim Personal Law without consultation with the community under the ruse of protection of Muslim women's rights, especially since the rights of 'abandoned wives' in other communities had not received similar attention. The, move is therefore seen as less than earnest, and mostly a form of Islamophobic signalling.

#### 2.8 National Register of Citizens in Assam

On 31<sup>st</sup> August 2019, the National Register of Citizens (NRC) – a process unique to Assam state - was published, excluding just under 2 million persons from the list, mostly Bengali speaking, both Muslim and Hindu - with high percentages of women, children and daily wage workers. Muslims in Assam off the NRC especially face the risk of statelessness, including indefinite incarceration in detention centres and being reduced in law as second class citizens – promoting Genocide Watch in August 2019 to renew its genocide alert for Assam, originally issued in 2018.<sup>13</sup> in The toxic Islamophobia that has been playing out in the state over past years – off line, including by senior state ministers such as Hemanto Biswa Sharma and on Facebook and WhatsApp – has been a reminder of the thin line to horror that played

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> NCRB data shown Muslims, Dalit, tribal population in prisons disproportionate to their population outside. <u>https://www.firstpost.com/india/ncrb-data-shows-muslims-dalits-tribal-population-in-prisons-disproportionate-to-their-numbers-outside-8775161.html</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Criminalising instant triple talaq makes Muslim men second class citizens. <u>https://www.dailyo.in/politics/triple-talaq-bill-muslim-men-second-class-citizen-modi-government-parliament/story/1/21443.html</u>

Triple Talaq: Why just Muslims, let us criminalise the abandonment of all wives. <u>https://thewire.in/law/triple-talaq-why-just-muslims-lets-criminalise-the-abandonment-of-all-wives</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Genocide Watch for Assam, India – Renewed. <u>https://www.genocidewatch.com/single-post/2019/08/18/genocide-watch-for-assam-india-renewed</u>

out in Assam during the 'foreigners movement' when in 1983, in Nellie in 2,500 Muslims – accused of being infiltrators - were massacred in a single day.<sup>14</sup>

#### 2.9 Babri Masjid verdict

The politicisation of the conflict around Babri Masjid – a medieval era mosque in northern Uttar Pradesh - made it the focal point of nationwide majoritarian mobilisation, especially during the 1980s. The mosque's demolition in 1992 by Hindu groups and led by the ruling BJP leadership - , sent a strong signal of disenfranchisement to the country's religious minority communities. The manufactured title dispute was instrumentalised to unleash violence against Muslim communities and catalyse their marginalisation from social and political spheres. In spite of the broader political commonsense lurching towards the right, various Muslim groups resolutely placed their trust in democratic institutions and struggled for justice, closure, and peace for almost 3 decades. In November 2019, the disputed land was handed over by the Supreme Court of India to a religious trust for the construction of a Hindu temple, even as it noted that the demolition of the mosque by Hindu groups was illegal and the perpetrators needed to be held accountable. But it did not feel the need to itself take any action on that.

## 2.10 Unending violations in Kashmir violations

In Kashmir, the only Muslim majority state in India, violations of human rights of civilians has been a longstanding phenomenon for several decades. This worsened since mid 2016, with the BJP settling down in power. The use of pellet shotguns against civilian protesters is a stark example of the systematic targeting- causing permanent blinding, besides other physical injuries. Arbitrary detentions, custodial torture and violence against children among other forms of targeting of civilians too rose sharply.<sup>15</sup> In 2019, central government unilaterally revoked Art. 370 of the Indian constitution that provided the state a modicum of autonomy, dividing the autonomous state into three federally administered territories. Effectively an 'annexation', the move converted Kashmiris from permanent residents of an autonomous state into domiciles of an unelected, bureaucratic government of India. The change in constitutional status of the state was enforced through the deployment of 100 additional companies of paramilitary forces and 25,000 more paramilitary personnel, adding to an already existing 5,00,000 + troops. It was also enforced through the incarceration of all Kashmiri political leaders and activists and a complete media and internet blackout of the state- that continues to this day. Along with Art 370, was abrogated Art 35A, that conferred the rights to define permanent residency and official employment in the state to the state government of J&K and its legislature, thus guaranteeing J&K's rights over land and state affairs. In March 2020, government passed an Adaptation Order extending fast track domicile

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> "Megaphone for Hate: Disinformation and Hate Speech on Facebook During Assam's Citizenship Count." Avaaz, October 2019.

https://avaazpress.s3.amazonaws.com/FINALFacebook%20in%20Assam\_Megaphone%20for%20hate%20-%20Compressed%20(1).pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup>First ever UN report on Kashmir calls for international enquiry into human rights violations. June 2018. <u>https://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=23198%20</u>

Update of the situation of Human rights in Indian AK and Pakistan AK, May 2018 to April 2019. <u>https://www.ohchr.org/\_layouts/15/WopiFrame.aspx?sourcedoc=/Documents/Countries/IN/KashmirUpdateR</u> <u>eport\_8July2019.pdf&action=default&DefaultItemOpen=1</u>

status to Indian citizens having resided or worked in J&K for a specified time period. In November 2020, the requirement of 'permanent residency' to buy land in J&K was done away with completely, further removing any obstacle to what is feared as being a planned demographic change of the Muslims majority state.

## 2.11 Citizenship Amendment Act 2019

In December 2019 Government amended the citizenship law, opening a pathway to Indian citizenship for a category of illegal immigrants - Hindus, Buddhists, Jains, Sikhs, Parsis and Christians from three Muslim majority community Pakistan, Afghanistan and Bangladesh leaving out Muslims specifically. Citizenship (Amendment) Act 2019 (CAA), by introducing a 'religion test' in India's citizenship legislation, strikes a body blow to the basic structure of Indian constitution, specifically its secular character; is wholly arbitrary, and violates principles of equality and non-discrimination, including on FoRB principles; besides contravening international law. UN called the law 'fundamentally discriminatory'.<sup>16</sup> Alongside, Government announced plans to prepare a nation-wide a register of citizens, - on the lines of one just prepared for Assam state - to 'detect, detain and deport' 'infiltrators', the favourite BJP dog whistle phrase for Muslims. Senior central ministers have been at pains to explain to their constituents how all-India NRC was meant to identify all those without proof of Indian nationality, that Hindus besides other groups, would be able to make use of the CAA to apply for naturalisation as Indians. Muslims alone, would be marked out for disenfranchisement. CAA – NRC is the latest pivot of anti-Muslim hostility against which Muslims and other citizens of India protested vigorously until March 2020 when the government imposed strict lockdowns owing to Covid19 pandemic.

## 2.12 Targeting and discriminatory enforcement

Since 2014, Muslims have suffered a heightened campaign of hate, vilification, and physical attacks, with senior BJP leaders at the forefront, and social media generously used as amplifier. In areas of Muslim concentrations – Assam, Delhi, Uttar Pradesh and particularly Muslim-majority Kashmir, the targeting has been more widespread and systematic. Perpetrators have suffered no accountability for their actions.

There were 902 incidents of documented hate crimes between 2015 to June 2019.<sup>17</sup> Between May 2015 and December 2018, at least 44 people—36 of them Muslim—were killed across 12 Indian states and around 280 people were injured across 20 states by vigilante groups with affiliations to RSS – the Hindutva platform.<sup>18</sup> The principal manifestation of this trend was the spate of mob lynchings and vigilante violence particularly against Muslims on the pretext of cow protection, love jihad, and other fabricated accusations.<sup>19</sup> Physical attacks increased in the same period – including mass violence as also everyday provocations and harassments of

<sup>17</sup> Amnesty International (2019) 'Halt the Hate', 4 October

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> <u>https://news.un.org/en/story/2019/12/1053511</u>

https://amnesty.org.in/wpcontent/uploads/2019/10/Halt-The-Hate-KeyFindings-Amnesty-International-India-1.pdf)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> 'Rising Hate in India', Washington Post, 31 October 2018

https://www.washingtonpost.com/graphics/2018/world/reports-of-hate-crime-cases-have-spiked-in-india/ <sup>19</sup> Al Jazeera Correspondent (2019), "Obvious religious hatred': Muslim man in India lynched on video' Al Jazeera 25 June. <u>https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2019/06/religious-hatred-muslim-manindia-lynched-video-190624141020360.html</u>

Muslims. Vigilante violence against Muslims by violent Hindu groups, including harassment, bullying and beating, as well as occasionally lynchings that resulted in deaths, have been widespread in northern Uttar Pradesh from 2017<sup>20</sup>, as have extra extrajudicial executions by Police in Uttar Pradesh and Mewat area of Haryana, mostly of Muslim youth.<sup>21</sup>

Anti-Muslim targeting rose sharply in the context of nation-wide protests against the CAA from late December 2019. Protesters faced restrictions to their freedom of assembly, as well as heavy-handed police response resulting in numerous injuries and deaths. 31 protesters were reported killed in police action, all in states ruled by BJP. 28 of these were Muslims. Police have been particularly aggressive in Uttar Pradesh engaging in what Human Rights Watch has called "Deadly Use of Force against Protesters". <sup>22</sup> Later on, in February 2020, mass targeted violence against Muslims took place unchecked for several days in North East district of capital Delhi, resulting in 53 deaths and hundreds made homeless. From the pronouncements of prominent leaders of the BJP it was apparent that the violence was meant to be reprisal for the dissent and protest by Muslim against the discriminatory and anti-Muslim CAA-NRC.<sup>23</sup>

When India went into a hard lockdown owing to the Covid19 pandemic in March 2020, a bigoted campaign vilifying Muslims began in the media, highlighting and exaggerating Muslims as super spreaders. A case of congregations of Tablighi Jamat – a Muslim religious group - members many of them foreigners who had entered into the country on valid visas was blown up as a spectacular case of Muslims as Covid-19 spreaders. Islamophobia in public sphere reached a crescendo with assertions on media by public figures from BJP and other government ministers who highlighted Tabhlighi Jamat cases as separate category in his daily Covid briefings to the media, making a bad situation worse.<sup>24</sup>

## 3. Social attitudes

The public sphere in India is saturated today with a culture in which anti-Muslim attitudes are openly expressed and used to legitimise anti-Muslim violence as 'deserved'. In addition, Hindu cultural symbols are aggressively pushed along with the violence. The violence in turn limits expression of Muslim cultures. For example, 'beef vigilantism' has resulted in restrictions on people's diets and livelihoods. There are other aspects too of this hardening anti-Muslim bias.

3.1 Anti-Muslim hate and incitement

An enabling environment for anti-Muslim targeting and hate has been nurtured by senior leaders of BJP. This combined with a culture of impunity against hate crimes, has resulted in the rise of targeting of minorities. In 2018, a study found the use of hateful and divisive

India: Deadly Force Used Against Protesters | Human Rights Watch (hrw.org)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Citizens Against Hate, 2018a. Lynching Without End.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Citizens Against Hate, 2018b. Countering the Silence.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Human Rights Watch. India: Deadly Force Used against Protesters.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> The violence in Delhi is not a 'riot' It is targeted anti-Muslim brutality.

https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2020/mar/01/violence-in-delhi-is-not-a-riot-it-is-targeted-antimuslim-brutality

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Covid-19: How fake news and Modi government messaging fuelled India's latest spiral of Islamophobia. <u>https://scroll.in/article/959806/covid-19-how-fake-news-and-modi-government-messaging-fuelled-indias-latest-spiral-of-islamophobia</u>

language by high-ranking politicians had increased almost 500 % in the previous four years, since 2014.<sup>25</sup> The investigation also found that politicians faced no consequences for these actions. Increasing access to social media platforms in the country has amplified hate speech, all with real world consequences. A BBC analysis of lynching cases found that at least 31 people were killed following fake rumours on WhatsApp between 2018-2019.<sup>26</sup> A similar study of hate content on Facebook in India recorded 37% of the hateful posts being Islamophobic.<sup>27</sup> In Assam, around the time the National Register of Citizens (NRC) exercise was coming to conclusion in 2018-19, a study of 800 Facebook posts found a preponderance of hate speech against Bengali Muslim immigrants, openly referred to as "criminals", "rapists", "terrorists", "pigs" and other dehumanising terms.<sup>28</sup> Recently, COVID -19 has provided opportunity to BJP and its affiliates to target Muslims in a systematic campaign of vilification, in the process making Muslims further vulnerable to stigmatisation, attacks, and exclusion. Politicians, mainstream TV channels and social media handles were all complicit in a 'pattern of targeted disinformation' of hyper-Islamophobia that played out over much of April 2020.<sup>29</sup>

## 3.2 Media hostility

Media hostility and malicious campaign against Muslims have been at an alarming high.<sup>30</sup> Most mainstream TV news channels and Hindi print newspapers popular in North India, like *Dainik Jagran* have been peddling hateful fake news or reporting in insidious ways to push anti-Muslim narrative.<sup>31</sup> It is widely noted that the news channels that do this the most blatantly and incessantly are also the ones that never critique the Modi government and enjoy impunity for their hate campaigns. This is clear from the government lawyer defending them in the supreme court.

#### 3.3 Economic boycott

Hindutva vigilante groups have been harassing Muslim businesses and calling for economic boycotts in states where BJP is in power. Fresh calls of economic boycotts were given when Muslims protested in anti-CAA agitation. Similar incidents were seen of Muslim vendors and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Under Modi Govt. VIP hate speech skyrockets by 500%' . 19 April 2018. NDTV.com <u>https://www.ndtv.com/india-news/under-narendra-modi-government-vip-hate-speech-skyrockets-by-500-</u> 1838925

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Nazmi, Nenwani & ors, S. & D. (2018) 'Social media rumours in India: counting the dead' BBC 13 November https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/resources/idt-e5043092-f7f0-42e9-9848- 5274ac896e6d

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Facebook India - Towards a Tipping Point of Violence Caste and Religious Hate Speech. Equality Labs, 2019. <u>https://www.equalitylabs.org/facebook-india-report</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> "Megaphone for Hate: Disinformation and Hate Speech on Facebook During Assam's Citizenship Count." Avaaz, October 2019.

https://avaazpress.s3.amazonaws.com/FINALFacebook%20in%20Assam\_Megaphone%20for%20hate%20-%20Compressed%20(1).pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> http://citizensagainsthate.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/05/HIt-Job-Final.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Journalism as Genocide. <u>https://thepolisproject.com/journalism-as-genocide/#.X8V5tGj7SJJ</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> India's Hate Muslim media factory: Case study of Hindi daily 'Dainik Jagran'. <u>https://countercurrents.org/2020/04/indias-hate-muslim-media-factory-case-study-of-hindi-daily-dainik-jagran/</u>

other businesses were given by resident welfare associations, and violence against Muslim shopkeepers and hawkers by Vigilante groups were reported.<sup>32</sup>

## 3.4 Falsification of history/erasing Muslim heritage

Apart from Babri Mosque, numerous other minor mosques of historical importance and other more contemporary structures have been destroyed or have been restricted from use by Muslims for prayers. Public institutions like Archaeological Survey of India and urban municipalities have been actively involved in furtively erasing Muslim heritage from the landscape of the country. BJP central and state governments have also been on a renaming spree, changing names of cities and roads which indicate a Muslim heritage. <sup>33</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Do not buy from Muslims'. BJP leader in India calls for boycott.

https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2020/4/29/do-not-buy-from-muslims-bjp-leader-in-india-calls-for-boycott After the riots, Hindutva Apartheid. https://frontline.thehindu.com/the-nation/article31149631.ece <sup>33</sup> Streets, Buildings, Museums: India is on a name changing spree to erase the Mughal history, https://www.vice.com/en/article/jgxz83/india-is-changing-names-of-streets-museums-cities-to-erase-mughalhistory

Tampering with history: How India's ruling party is erasing the Muslim heritage of the nation's cities. https://newscentral24x7.com/india-bjp-erasing-muslim-heritage-mughal-allahabad-hindu-nationalism/