



OFFICE OF THE HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS
IN COOPERATION WITH THE
INTERNATIONAL BAR ASSOCIATION



PROFESSIONAL TRAINING SERIES No. 9

**HUMAN RIGHTS IN THE
ADMINISTRATION OF JUSTICE:
A Manual on Human Rights
for Judges, Prosecutors and Lawyers**



UNITED NATIONS
New York and Geneva, 2003

CONTENTS

Foreword by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights.....	xxvii
Foreword by the International Bar Association.....	xxix
Acknowledgements.....	xxxi
Addendum – Major Recent Developments (2002 – March 2003).....	xxxii
Abbreviations.....	xxxiv

Chapter 1 **International Human Rights Law and the Role** **of the Legal Professions: A General Introduction 1**

Learning Objectives	1
Questions.....	1
1. Introduction	2
2. Origin, Meaning and Scope of International Human Rights Law.....	2
2.1 The Charter of the United Nations and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights	2
2.2 The ethical dimension of human rights	4
2.3 Human rights and their impact on national and international peace, security and development.....	5
2.4 The sources of law.....	6
2.4.1 <i>International treaties</i>	7
2.4.2 <i>International customary law</i>	8
2.4.3 <i>General principles of law recognized by the community of nations</i>	11
2.4.4 <i>Subsidiary means for the determination of rules of law</i>	11
2.5 International human rights law and international humanitarian law: common concerns and basic differences.....	12
2.6 Reservations and interpretative declarations to international human rights treaties.....	13
2.7 Limitations on the exercise of rights	15
2.8 Derogations from international legal obligations	16
2.9 International State responsibility for human rights violations	17
3. Business Corporations and Human Rights	19
4. International Human Rights Law at the Domestic Level.....	20
4.1 Incorporating international law into domestic legal systems.....	20

4.2	The application of international human rights law in domestic courts: some practical examples.....	22
5.	The Role of the Legal Professions in the Implementation of Human Rights.....	25
6.	Concluding Remarks.....	25

Chapter 2 The Major Universal Human Rights Instruments and the Mechanisms for Their Implementation.....27

	Learning Objectives.....	27
	Questions.....	27
1.	Introduction.....	28
1.1	Scope of the chapter.....	28
1.2	The international treaty-based control mechanisms.....	28
1.3	Civil and political rights, and economic, social and cultural rights.....	30
2.	The Major United Nations Human Rights Treaties and their Implementation.....	31
2.1	The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966, and its two Protocols, 1966 and 1989.....	31
2.1.1	<i>The undertakings of the States parties.....</i>	31
2.1.2	<i>The rights recognized.....</i>	32
2.1.3	<i>Permissible limitations on the exercise of rights.....</i>	34
2.1.4	<i>Permissible derogations from legal obligations.....</i>	36
2.1.5	<i>The implementation mechanisms.....</i>	38
2.2	The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1966.....	39
2.2.1	<i>The undertakings of the States parties.....</i>	40
2.2.2	<i>The rights recognized.....</i>	40
2.2.3	<i>Permissible limitations on rights.....</i>	41
2.2.4	<i>The implementation mechanism.....</i>	42
2.3	The Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1989 and its two Optional Protocols, 2000.....	43
2.3.1	<i>The undertakings of the States parties.....</i>	43
2.3.2	<i>The rights recognized.....</i>	44
2.3.3	<i>Permissible limitations on the exercise of rights.....</i>	46
2.3.4	<i>The implementation mechanism.....</i>	47
2.4	The Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, 1948.....	47
2.4.1	<i>The undertakings of the States parties.....</i>	48
2.4.2	<i>The legal scope of the Convention.....</i>	48
2.4.3	<i>International crimes: recent legal developments.....</i>	49

2.5	The International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965.....	50
2.5.1	<i>The undertakings of the States parties</i>	50
2.5.2	<i>The field of non-discrimination protected</i>	51
2.5.3	<i>The implementation mechanism</i>	53
2.6	The Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 1984.....	54
2.6.1	<i>The undertakings of the States parties</i>	54
2.6.2	<i>The legal scope of the Convention</i>	55
2.6.3	<i>The implementation mechanism</i>	56
2.7	The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, 1979, and its Protocol, 1999.....	58
2.7.1	<i>The undertakings of the States parties</i>	58
2.7.2	<i>The specific legal scope of the Convention</i>	59
2.7.3	<i>The implementation mechanisms</i>	60
3.	Other Instruments Adopted by the United Nations General Assembly.....	61
3.1	The Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief, 1981.....	62
3.2	The Basic Principles for the Treatment of Prisoners, 1990.....	62
3.3	The Body of Principles for the Protection of All Persons under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment, 1988.....	63
3.4	The United Nations Rules for the Protection of Juveniles Deprived of their Liberty, 1990.....	63
3.5	The Principles of Medical Ethics relevant to the Role of Health Personnel, particularly Physicians, in the Protection of Prisoners and Detainees against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 1982.....	63
3.6	The Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials, 1979.....	64
3.7	The United Nations Standard Minimum Rules for Non-custodial Measures (The Tokyo Rules), 1990.....	64
3.8	The United Nations Guidelines for the Prevention of Juvenile Delinquency (The Riyadh Guidelines), 1990.....	65
3.9	The United Nations Standard Minimum Rules for the Administration of Juvenile Justice (The Beijing Rules), 1985.....	65
3.10	The Declaration of Basic Principles of Justice for Victims of Crime and Abuse of Power, 1985.....	65
3.11	The Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance, 1992.....	66
3.12	The Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, 1998.....	66
4.	Instruments adopted by the United Nations Congress on the Prevention of Crime and the Treatment of Offenders.....	67

5. United Nations Extra-Conventional Mechanisms for Human Rights Monitoring	67
5.1 Special procedures I: Thematic and country mandates	68
5.2 Special procedures II: The 1503 complaints procedure	69
6. Concluding Remarks.....	70

Chapter 3

The Major Regional Human Rights Instruments and the Mechanisms for Their Implementation.....71

Learning Objectives	71
Questions.....	71
1. Introduction.....	72
2. African Human Rights Treaties and their Implementation.....	72
2.1. The African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights, 1981	72
2.1.1 <i>The undertakings of the States parties</i>	73
2.1.2 <i>The individual and collective rights recognized</i>	73
2.1.3 <i>The individual duties</i>	74
2.1.4 <i>Permissible limitations on the exercise of rights</i>	75
2.1.5 <i>Derogations from legal obligations</i>	75
2.1.6 <i>The implementation mechanism</i>	75
2.2 The African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, 1990	77
2.2.1 <i>The undertakings of the States parties</i>	78
2.2.2 <i>The rights recognized</i>	78
2.2.3 <i>The child’s duties</i>	79
2.2.4 <i>The implementation mechanism</i>	79
3. American Human Rights Treaties and their Implementation.....	80
3.1 The American Convention on Human Rights, 1969, and its Protocols of 1988 and 1990.....	80
3.1.1 <i>The undertakings of the States parties</i>	81
3.1.2 <i>The rights recognized</i>	82
3.1.3 <i>Permissible limitations on the exercise of rights</i>	84
3.1.4 <i>Permissible derogations from legal obligations</i>	86
3.1.5 <i>The implementation mechanism</i>	87
3.2 The Inter-American Convention to Prevent and Punish Torture, 1985	90
3.2.1 <i>The scope of the Convention</i>	90
3.2.2 <i>The undertakings of the States parties</i>	90
3.2.3 <i>The implementation mechanism</i>	91
3.3 The Inter-American Convention on Forced Disappearance of Persons, 1994	91
3.3.1 <i>The scope of the Convention</i>	91
3.3.2 <i>The undertakings of the States parties</i>	92

3.3.3	<i>The implementation mechanism</i>	92
3.4	The Inter-American Convention on the Prevention, Punishment and Eradication of Violence against Women, 1994.....	93
3.4.1	<i>The scope of the Convention</i>	93
3.4.2	<i>The undertakings of the States parties</i>	94
3.4.3	<i>The implementation mechanism</i>	94
4.	European Human Rights Treaties and Their Implementation	95
4.1	The European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, and its Protocols Nos. 1, 4, 6 and 7	95
4.1.1	<i>The undertakings of the States parties</i>	95
4.1.2	<i>The rights guaranteed</i>	95
4.1.3	<i>Permissible limitations on the exercise of rights</i>	97
4.1.4	<i>Permissible derogations from legal obligations</i>	99
4.1.5	<i>The implementation mechanism</i>	100
4.2.	The European Social Charter, 1961, and its Protocols of 1988, 1991 and 1995.....	102
4.2.1	<i>The undertakings of the States parties</i>	102
4.2.2	<i>The rights recognized</i>	102
4.2.3	<i>Permissible limitation on the exercise of rights</i>	103
4.2.4	<i>Permissible derogations from legal obligations</i>	104
4.2.5	<i>The implementation mechanism</i>	104
4.3	The European Social Charter (revised), 1996.....	106
4.4	The European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 1987	107
4.4.1	<i>The undertakings of the States parties and the monitoring mechanism</i>	107
4.5	The Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, 1995.....	108
4.5.1	<i>The undertakings of the States parties</i>	109
4.5.2	<i>Permissible limitations on the exercise of rights</i>	110
4.5.3	<i>The implementation mechanism</i>	110
5.	Concluding Remarks	111

Chapter 4 Independence and Impartiality of Judges, Prosecutors and Lawyers..... 113

Learning Objectives	113
Questions	113
Relevant Legal Instruments.....	114
1. Introduction.....	115
2. The Role of Judges, Prosecutors and Lawyers in Upholding the Rule of Law, Including Human Rights Standards	115

3.	Challenges to the Independence and Impartiality of the Legal Professions	116
4.	International Law and the Independence and Impartiality of the Judiciary	117
4.1	Applicable international law	117
4.2	Basic Principles on the Independence of the Judiciary, 1985	119
4.3	The notions of independence and impartiality: links and basic differences	119
4.4	The notion of institutional independence	120
4.4.1	<i>Independence as to administrative matters</i>	120
4.4.2	<i>Independence as to financial matters</i>	121
4.4.3	<i>Independence as to decision-making</i>	121
4.4.4	<i>Jurisdictional competence</i>	122
4.4.5	<i>The right and duty to ensure fair court proceedings and give reasoned decisions</i>	122
4.5	The notion of individual independence.....	123
4.5.1	<i>Appointment</i>	123
4.5.2	<i>Security of tenure</i>	127
4.5.3	<i>Financial security</i>	128
4.5.4	<i>Promotion</i>	129
4.5.5	<i>Accountability</i>	129
4.5.6	<i>Freedom of expression and association</i>	132
4.5.7	<i>Training and education</i>	133
4.5.8	<i>The right and duty to ensure fair court proceedings and give reasoned decisions</i>	134
4.6	The notion of impartiality.....	135
4.7	Military and other special courts and tribunals.....	139
5.	International Law and the Independence of Prosecutors	147
5.1	Guidelines on the Role of Prosecutors, 1990	147
5.2	Professional qualifications	147
5.3	Status and conditions of service.....	148
5.4	Freedom of expression and association.....	148
5.5	The role in criminal proceedings	148
5.6	Alternatives to prosecution.....	149
5.7	Accountability	150
6.	International Law and the Independence of Lawyers	150
6.1	Applicable international law	150
6.2	Duties and responsibilities	151
6.3	Guarantees for the functioning of lawyers.....	151
6.4	Lawyers and fundamental freedoms	153
6.4.1	<i>Executive permission to exercise the legal profession</i>	153
6.4.2	<i>The right to peaceful assembly</i>	154
6.4.3	<i>The right to freedom of association</i>	155
6.4.4	<i>The right to freedom of expression</i>	156

6.5	Codes of professional discipline	157
7.	Concluding Remarks	158

Chapter 5

Human Rights and Arrest, Pre-trial Detention and Administrative Detention..... 159

Learning Objectives.....	159
Questions	159
Relevant Legal Instruments.....	160
1. Introduction.....	161
2. Arrests and Detention without Reasonable Cause: a Persistent Problem	161
3. The Right to Liberty and Security of the Person: Field of Applicability of the Legal Protection	162
3.1 Universal legal responsibility: All States are bound by the law	162
3.2 The notion of security of person: State responsibility to act.....	162
4. Lawful Arrests and Detentions	163
4.1 The legal texts	163
4.2 The notions of lawfulness and arbitrariness: their meaning.....	165
4.2.1 <i>Unacknowledged detentions, abductions and involuntary disappearances.....</i>	169
4.3 Detention after conviction.....	172
4.4 Arrest and detention for non-compliance with the lawful order of a court or in order to secure the fulfilment of any obligation prescribed by law	173
4.5 Detention on reasonable suspicion of having committed an offence	173
4.5.1 <i>The meaning of “reasonableness”.....</i>	174
4.6 Detention in order to prevent flight.....	175
4.7 Administrative detention.....	175
4.7.1 <i>Deprivation of liberty for the purpose of educational supervision.....</i>	176
4.7.2 <i>Deprivation of liberty for reasons of mental health.....</i>	177
4.7.3 <i>Deprivation of liberty of asylum seekers and for purposes of deportation and extradition</i>	179
4.7.4 <i>Preventive detention and detention for reasons of ordre public</i>	180
4.8 The right to be promptly informed of reasons for arrest and detention and of any charges against oneself.....	181
4.9 The right to be promptly brought before a judge or other judicial officer	185
4.9.1 <i>The legitimate decision-making organ.....</i>	189

5.	The Right to Trial within a Reasonable Time or to Release pending Trial.....	190
5.1	The notion of “reasonable time”	191
5.2	Alternatives to detention on remand: guarantees to appear at trial.....	195
6.	The Right to Have the Lawfulness of the Detention Decided Speedily or Without Delay by a Court.....	197
6.1	The legal procedures complying with this requirement	199
6.2	The notions of “speedily” and “without delay”	206
7.	The Right of Access to and Assistance of a Lawyer.....	208
8.	The Right to Compensation in the Event of Unlawful Deprivation of Liberty	209
9.	<i>Incommunicado</i> Detention.....	210
10.	Concluding Remarks	211

Chapter 6

The Right to a Fair Trial:

Part I – From Investigation to Trial213

	Learning Objectives.....	213
	Questions	213
	Relevant Legal Instruments.....	214
1.	Introduction.....	215
2.	The Effective Protection of the Right to a Fair Trial: A Global Challenge.....	215
3.	The Legal Texts.....	216
4.	The Right to Equality before the Law and Equal Treatment by the Law	217
5.	The Right to be Presumed Innocent: the Overall Guarantee from Suspicion to Conviction or Acquittal.....	219
6.	Human Rights during Criminal Investigations.....	223
6.1	The right to respect for one’s private life, home and correspondence.....	223
6.1.1	<i>Wire tapping</i>	224
6.1.2	<i>Searches</i>	227
6.1.3	<i>Interference with correspondence</i>	228
6.2	The right to be treated with humanity and the right to freedom from torture.....	230
6.3	The right to be notified of the charges in a language one understands	232

6.4	The right to legal assistance	235
6.5	The right not to be forced to testify against oneself/ The right to remain silent.....	240
6.6	The duty to keep records of interrogation	243
6.7	The right to adequate time and facilities to prepare one's defence	244
7.	Concluding Remarks	248

Chapter 7

The Right to a Fair Trial:

Part II – From Trial to Final Judgement251

Learning Objectives.....	251
Questions	251
Relevant Legal Instruments.....	252
1. Introduction.....	253
2. The Legal Provisions	253
3. Human Rights during Trial.....	253
3.1 The right to be tried by a competent, independent and impartial tribunal established by law	253
3.2 The right to a fair hearing	254
3.2.1 <i>The right of access to a court or tribunal.....</i>	257
3.2.2 <i>The right to equality of arms and adversarial proceedings.....</i>	258
3.2.3 <i>The detention of witnesses</i>	261
3.2.4 <i>Judge's instructions to the jury.....</i>	261
3.3 The right to a public hearing	262
3.3.1 <i>The right to a public judgement.....</i>	265
3.4 The right to be tried “without undue delay” or “within a reasonable time”.....	267
3.5 The right to defend oneself in person or through a lawyer of one's own choice	271
3.5.1 <i>The right to effective legal assistance in death penalty cases.....</i>	274
3.5.2 <i>The right to free legal aid.....</i>	277
3.5.3 <i>The right to privileged communications with one's lawyer</i>	279
3.6 The right to be present at one's trial	280
3.6.1 <i>Trials in absentia.....</i>	280
3.7 The right not to be compelled to testify against oneself or to confess guilt.....	282
3.7.1 <i>Prohibition on the use of evidence obtained through unlawful means/treatment.....</i>	283
3.8 The right to call, examine, or have examined, witnesses	285
3.8.1 <i>Anonymous witnesses.....</i>	288

3.9	The right to free assistance of an interpreter	291
3.10	The right to a reasoned judgement.....	293
3.10.1	<i>The lack of a reasoned judgement and capital punishment cases</i>	294
3.11	Freedom from ex post facto laws/The principle of <i>nullum crimen sine lege</i>	295
3.12	The principle of <i>ne bis in idem</i> , or prohibition of double jeopardy	297
4.	Limits on Punishment	301
4.1	The right to benefit from a lighter penalty	301
4.2	Consistency with international legal standards	301
4.2.1	<i>Corporal punishment</i>	302
4.2.2	<i>Capital punishment</i>	303
5.	The Right of Appeal	305
5.1	The right to full review.....	306
5.2	The availability of a judgement	307
5.3	Transcripts of the trial	307
5.4	Preservation of evidence	307
5.5	The right to legal aid	308
6.	The Right to Compensation in the Event of a Miscarriage of Justice	309
7.	The Right to a Fair Trial and Special Tribunals	310
8.	The Right to a Fair Trial in Public Emergencies.....	311
9.	Concluding Remarks	313

Chapter 8

International Legal Standards for the Protection of Persons Deprived of Their Liberty315

Learning Objectives	315
Questions	315
Relevant Legal Instruments	316
1. Introduction.....	317
1.1 Use of terms.....	318
2. The Prohibition of Torture and Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment.....	318
2.1 Introductory remarks.....	318
2.2 Legal responsibilities of States	319
2.3 The notions of torture and cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment: definitions and understandings	323
2.3.1 <i>Rape as torture</i>	325
2.3.2 <i>Treatment of detainees and prisoners</i>	327

2.3.3	Corporal punishment.....	330
2.3.4	Medical or scientific experimentation.....	331
2.4	Torture and law enforcement officials, health personnel and prosecutors.....	332
3.	Legal Requirements as to Places of Detention and Registration of Detainees and Prisoners.....	334
3.1	Official recognition of all places of detention.....	334
3.2	Registration of detainees and prisoners.....	335
4.	Conditions of Detention and Imprisonment.....	337
4.1	Basic principles governing detention and imprisonment.....	337
4.2	Accommodation.....	339
4.2.1	Separation of categories.....	341
4.3	Personal hygiene, food, health and medical services.....	342
4.4	Religion.....	348
4.5	Recreational activities.....	349
4.6	Solitary confinement.....	350
4.6.1	Incommunicado detention.....	352
5.	Contacts with the Outside World.....	356
5.1	Contact with family members and friends: visits and correspondence.....	356
5.1.1	The rights of visitors to detainees and prisoners.....	358
5.2	Contact with lawyers: visits and correspondence.....	360
6.	Inspection of Places of Detention and Complaints Procedures.....	365
6.1	Inspection of places of detention.....	365
6.2	Complaints procedures.....	366
7.	The Role of Judges, Prosecutors and Lawyers in Preventing and Remediating Unlawful Treatment of Persons Deprived of their Liberty.....	369
8.	Concluding Remarks.....	370

Chapter 9

The Use of Non-Custodial Measures in the Administration of Justice371

Learning Objectives.....	371
Questions.....	371
Relevant Legal Instruments.....	372
1. Introduction.....	373
1.1 The purpose of non-custodial measures and the Tokyo Rules.....	373

2.	Terminology.....	374
2.1	The term “non-custodial measures”	374
2.2	The term “offender”	374
2.3	The term “competent authority”	375
3.	General Principles Relating to Non-custodial Measures	375
3.1	The fundamental aims of non-custodial measures	375
3.2	The scope of non-custodial measures.....	377
3.2.1	<i>The general scope of non-custodial measures.....</i>	<i>377</i>
3.2.2	<i>The prohibition of discrimination.....</i>	<i>377</i>
3.2.3	<i>Flexibility in application.....</i>	<i>378</i>
3.3	Legal safeguards.....	380
3.3.1	<i>The principle of legality.....</i>	<i>380</i>
3.3.2	<i>The criteria for resorting to non-custodial measures and the need for discretion.....</i>	<i>380</i>
3.3.3	<i>The requirement of consent.....</i>	<i>381</i>
3.3.4	<i>The right to review.....</i>	<i>381</i>
3.3.5	<i>Restrictions on the imposition of non-custodial measures</i>	<i>382</i>
4.	Non-custodial Options at the Different Stages of the Judicial Process.....	384
4.1	Non-custodial measures at the pre-trial stage.....	384
4.2	Non-custodial measures at the trial and sentencing stage	385
4.3	Non-custodial measures at the post-sentencing stage.....	387
5.	Implementation of Non-custodial Measures	389
5.1	The supervision of non-custodial measures.....	389
5.2	The duration of non-custodial measures	391
5.3	The conditions attached to non-custodial measures	391
5.4	The treatment process	392
5.5	Discipline and breach of conditions.....	393
6.	The Role of Judges, Prosecutors and Lawyers in Choosing Alternatives to Imprisonment.....	395
7.	Concluding Remarks	396

Chapter 10

The Rights of the Child in the Administration of Justice397

Learning Objectives.....	397
Questions	397
Relevant Legal Instruments.....	398
1. Introduction.....	399
1.1 Terminology.....	400

2.	The Administration of Justice and Children: Persistent Concerns	400
3.	The Definition of “Child”	401
3.1	The age of majority in general.....	401
3.2	The age of criminal responsibility.....	401
4.	The Rights of the Child in the Administration of Justice: Some Basic Principles.....	404
4.1	The principle of non-discrimination	404
4.2	The best interests of the child.....	405
4.3	The child’s right to life, survival and development.....	406
4.4	The child’s right to be heard.....	407
5.	The Aims of Juvenile Justice	408
6.	The Duty to Create a Juvenile Justice System	411
7.	The Accused Child and the Administration of Justice.....	411
7.1	The right to freedom from torture and from cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment	412
7.2	General treatment of the child/the child’s best interests.....	413
7.3	Some fundamental procedural rights	414
7.3.1	<i>The principle of nullum crimen sine lege</i>	414
7.3.2	<i>The right to be presumed innocent</i>	415
7.3.3	<i>The right to prompt information and the right to legal assistance</i>	415
7.3.4	<i>The right to be tried without delay</i>	416
7.3.5	<i>The right not to incriminate oneself and the right to examine and have witnesses</i>	417
7.3.6	<i>The right to review</i>	417
7.3.7	<i>The right to free assistance of an interpreter</i>	418
7.3.8	<i>The right to respect for privacy</i>	418
8.	The Child and Deprivation of Liberty.....	420
8.1	The meaning of deprivation of liberty	421
8.2	Deprivation of liberty: a measure of last resort.....	421
8.3	The rights of the child deprived of liberty	422
8.3.1	<i>The right to humane treatment</i>	422
8.3.2	<i>The right of the child to be separated from adults</i>	423
8.3.3	<i>The right of the child to remain in contact with his or her family</i>	424
8.3.4	<i>The child’s rights to prompt access to legal assistance and to legal challenge of detention</i>	424
8.3.5	<i>The child and the general conditions of detention</i>	425
8.3.6	<i>The rights of the child and disciplinary measures</i>	427
9.	The Rights of the Child and Penal Sanctions	429
10.	The Accused Child and the Question of Diversion	430
10.1	The meaning of the term “diversion”	430
10.2	Diversion and the responsible authorities.....	431

10.3	Diversion and consent of the child	432
11.	The Child as Victim or Witness in Judicial Proceedings.....	433
12.	The Child and His or Her Parents: When Separation May be Justified.....	436
12.1	The best interests of the child.....	436
12.2	The grounds justifying separation.....	436
12.3	The legal safeguards	437
12.4	The child’s right to remain in contact with his or her parents	438
13.	The Rights of the Child and Adoption Proceedings	439
14.	The Role of Judges, Prosecutors and Lawyers in Guaranteeing the Rights of the Child in the Course of the Administration of Justice.....	442
15.	Concluding Remarks	443

Chapter 11 Women’s Rights in the Administration of Justice445

	Learning Objectives.....	445
	Questions	445
	Relevant Legal Instruments.....	446
1.	Introduction.....	447
2.	Women’s Right to Legal Personality.....	449
3.	Women’s Right to Equality Before the Law and Equal Protection of the Law.....	450
3.1	The Charter of the United Nations and the International Bill of Human Rights.....	450
3.2	The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, 1979	450
3.3	Regional human rights treaties	453
3.4	The meaning of the principle of gender equality and non-discrimination between women and men	453
3.4.1	<i>The general meaning of equality and non-discrimination</i>	<i>454</i>
3.4.2	<i>The meaning of equality between women and men.....</i>	<i>454</i>
4.	Women’s Right to Respect for their Life and their Physical and Mental Integrity	458
4.1	Relevant legal provisions.....	458
4.2	The right to life.....	461
4.2.1	<i>Abduction and murder.....</i>	<i>461</i>
4.2.2	<i>Dowry violence and “honour” killings.....</i>	<i>462</i>
4.2.3	<i>Female genital mutilation</i>	<i>463</i>

4.2.4	<i>Abortion</i>	464
4.2.5	<i>Infant mortality and life expectancy</i>	465
4.3	The right to freedom from torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment.....	466
4.3.1	<i>Violence against women deprived of their liberty</i>	467
4.3.2	<i>Unlawful punishments</i>	469
4.3.3	<i>Violence against women and the girl child in families and the community in general</i>	472
4.4	Violence against women as crimes against humanity and war crimes.....	477
5.	Women's Right to Freedom from Slavery, the Slave Trade, Forced and Compulsory Labour, and Trafficking.....	478
5.1	Relevant legal provisions.....	478
5.1.1	<i>Slavery, the slave trade and servitude</i>	478
5.1.2	<i>Forced and compulsory labour</i>	479
5.1.3	<i>Trafficking</i>	479
5.2	The practice of slavery, forced and compulsory labour, and trafficking in women.....	481
6.	The Right to Equality in respect of Marriage	484
6.1	The right of intending spouses to marry freely and to found a family.....	484
6.1.1	<i>Polygamous marriages</i>	486
6.1.2	<i>The marriageable age</i>	487
6.1.3	<i>Other de jure and de facto impediments to the right to marry freely</i>	488
6.1.4	<i>Restrictions on remarriage</i>	489
6.1.5	<i>Registration of marriages</i>	490
6.1.6	<i>Meaning of the right to found a family</i>	491
6.2	Equality of rights in terms of nationality laws	493
6.3	The equal right to a name	495
6.4	Equal rights and responsibilities of spouses as to marriage, during marriage and at its dissolution	496
6.4.1	<i>Relevant legal provisions</i>	496
6.4.2	<i>General understanding of the principle of equal rights and responsibilities</i>	497
6.4.3	<i>Equal right to decision-making</i>	498
6.4.4	<i>Equal parental rights and responsibilities</i>	498
6.4.5	<i>Equal rights to marital property</i>	499
6.4.6	<i>The equal right to a profession and an occupation</i>	500
6.4.7	<i>Women living in de facto unions</i>	500
6.4.8	<i>Equality with respect to divorce</i>	501
6.4.9	<i>The equal right of succession between spouses</i>	501
7.	The Equal Right to Legal Capacity in Civil Matters	502
7.1	Equal rights to administer property and conclude contracts	502
7.2	The equal right to succession in general.....	504

8. The Right to Equal Participation in Public Affairs, including Elections	505
8.1 Relevant legal provisions	505
8.2 The interpretation of article 25 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	507
8.3 The interpretation of articles 7 and 8 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women.....	508
9. Women’s Right to Equal Enjoyment of Other Human Rights	511
9.1 The right to freedom of movement and residence	511
9.2 The right to privacy.....	512
9.3 Freedom of thought, conscience, belief, religion, opinion, expression, association and assembly.....	513
9.4 The right to education	514
10. Women’s Right to an Effective Remedy, including the Right of Access to the Courts and Due Process of Law	516
11. The Role of Judges, Prosecutors and Lawyers in Ensuring Protection of the Rights of Women.....	519
12. Concluding Remarks	520

Chapter 12

Some Other Key Rights: Freedom of Thought, Conscience, Religion, Opinion, Expression, Association and Assembly

521

Learning Objectives.....	521
Questions	521
Relevant Legal Instruments.....	522
1. Introduction.....	523
2. The Right to Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion.....	524
2.1 Relevant legal provisions.....	524
2.2 General meaning of the right to freedom of thought, conscience and religion.....	525
2.2.1 <i>Article 18 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</i>	525
2.2.2 <i>Article 8 of the African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights</i>	527
2.2.3 <i>Article 12 of the American Convention on Human Rights</i>	527
2.2.4 <i>Article 9 of the European Convention on Human Rights</i>	528
2.3 The right to manifest one’s religion or belief.....	530
2.3.1 <i>Limitations on the right to manifest one’s religion or belief</i>	533
2.3.2 <i>Prohibitions on the freedom to manifest one’s religion or belief</i>	540

2.4	Freedom of religion and public school instruction.....	540
2.5	State religion and religious minorities	543
2.6	Conscientious objection on religious grounds.....	544
3.	The Right to Freedom of Opinion and Expression	546
3.1	Relevant legal provisions.....	546
3.2	Article 19 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	548
3.2.1	<i>Choice of language in court</i>	549
3.2.2	<i>Advertising</i>	549
3.2.3	<i>Defamation and dissemination of false information</i>	550
3.2.4	<i>Denial of crimes against humanity and advocacy of hatred</i>	552
3.2.5	<i>Threats to national security and public order</i>	554
3.2.6	<i>Freedom of the press</i>	557
3.2.7	<i>Human rights defenders</i>	561
3.3	Article 9 of the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights.....	561
3.3.1	<i>Freedom of the press</i>	562
3.3.2	<i>Freedom to express opinions</i>	564
3.3.3	<i>Human rights defenders</i>	564
3.4	Article 13 of the American Convention on Human Rights.....	565
3.4.1	<i>The individual and collective dimensions of freedom of expression, including the role of the mass media</i>	567
3.4.2	<i>Freedom of expression and the concept of public order in a democratic society</i>	570
3.4.3	<i>Restrictions on freedom of expression: Meaning of the term “necessary to ensure”</i>	571
3.4.4	<i>Indirect control of the mass media: The case of Ivcher Bronstein v. Peru</i>	572
3.4.5	<i>Article 13(2) and the Compulsory Licensing of Journalists case</i>	573
3.5	Article 10 of the European Convention on Human Rights	575
3.5.1	<i>Basic interpretative approach to freedom of expression</i>	576
3.5.2	<i>Freedom of the press</i>	579
3.5.3	<i>Freedom of expression of elected members of professional organizations</i>	589
3.5.4	<i>Freedom of expression of elected politicians</i>	592
3.5.5	<i>Freedom of artistic expression</i>	594
4.	The Rights to Freedom of Association and Assembly.....	597
4.1	Relevant legal provisions.....	597
4.2	Articles 21 and 22 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	599
4.2.1	<i>Origin and meaning of the “in a democratic society” concept</i>	599
4.2.2	<i>Freedom of association</i>	601
4.2.3	<i>Freedom of assembly</i>	602
4.3.	Articles 10 and 11 of the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights.....	604
4.3.1	<i>Freedom of association</i>	604
4.4	Articles 15 and 16 of the American Convention on Human Rights.....	606

4.5	Article 11 of the European Convention on Human Rights	608
4.5.1	<i>Freedom of association, trade unions and the closed shop system</i>	609
4.5.2	<i>Trade unions and collective agreements</i>	612
4.5.3	<i>Freedom of association and political parties</i>	614
4.5.4	<i>A lawyer's right to freedom of assembly</i>	627
5.	The Role of Judges, Prosecutors and Lawyers in Ensuring Protection of Freedom of Thought, Conscience, Religion, Opinion, Expression, Association and Assembly	629
6.	Concluding Remarks	630

Chapter 13

The Right to Equality and Non-Discrimination in the Administration of Justice631

Learning Objectives.....	631
Questions	631
Relevant Legal Instruments.....	632
1. Introduction.....	633
1.1 Discrimination: A persistent serious human rights violation	633
1.2 The role of judges, prosecutors and lawyers in protecting persons against discrimination	634
1.3 Glimpses of international legal history	634
1.4 The purpose and scope of the present chapter	635
2. Selected Universal Legal Provisions Guaranteeing the Right to Equality before the Law and the Right to Non-discrimination.....	636
2.1 Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 1948.....	636
2.2 Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, 1948.....	637
2.3 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966	638
2.4 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1966.....	639
2.5 International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 1965.....	639
2.6 Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1989.....	640
2.7 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, 1979.....	641
2.8 Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief, 1981	642
2.9 Declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National or Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities, 1992.....	642

3.	Selected Regional Legal Provisions Guaranteeing the Right to Equality before the Law and the Right to Non-discrimination.....	643
3.1	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 1981	643
3.2	African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, 1990	644
3.3	American Convention on Human Rights, 1969.....	644
3.4	Additional Protocol to the American Convention on Human Rights in the Area of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1988.....	645
3.5	Inter-American Convention on the Prevention, Punishment, and Eradication of Violence against Women, 1994	645
3.6	Inter-American Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Persons with Disabilities, 1999.....	646
3.7	European Convention on Human Rights, 1950.....	646
3.8	European Social Charter, 1961, and European Social Charter (revised), 1996.....	647
3.9	Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, 1994.....	648
4.	The Prohibition of Discrimination and Public Emergencies.....	649
5.	The General Meaning of Equality and Non-Discrimination	651
6.	Selected International Case Law and Legal Comments on the Right to Equality and the Prohibition of Discrimination	656
6.1	Race, colour or ethnic origin	656
6.1.1	<i>Racial slurs</i>	656
6.1.2	<i>The right to freedom of movement and residence</i>	657
6.1.3	<i>Racial and ethnic discrimination in law enforcement</i>	658
6.1.4	<i>Racial discrimination in ensuring economic, social and cultural rights</i>	658
6.2	Gender	659
6.2.1	<i>The right to represent matrimonial property</i>	659
6.2.2	<i>Right to respect for family life</i>	659
6.2.3	<i>Preferential pension rights</i>	661
6.2.4	<i>Social security benefits</i>	662
6.2.5	<i>Contributions to general child-care benefit schemes</i>	662
6.2.6	<i>Parental leave allowance</i>	663
6.2.7	<i>Acquisition of citizenship</i>	664
6.3	Language.....	665
6.4	Religion or belief	666
6.4.1	<i>Conscientious objection to military service</i>	666
6.4.2	<i>Duty to wear safety gear at work</i>	668
6.4.3	<i>Public funding of religious schools</i>	669
6.4.4	<i>Lack of public-law status for purposes of bringing court proceedings</i>	669
6.5	Property	670
6.6	Birth or other status.....	671
6.6.1	<i>Social security benefits for married/unmarried couples</i>	671
6.6.2	<i>Inheritance rights</i>	672
6.6.3	<i>Conditions of birth or descent for presidential candidates</i>	673

6.7	National origin.....	674
6.8	Sexual orientation.....	675
6.9	Minorities.....	676
	6.9.1 <i>Right to one's own culture</i>	676
	6.9.2 <i>Right to reside in an Indian reserve</i>	677
7.	Concluding Remarks	678

Chapter 14 The Role of the Courts in Protecting Economic, Social and Cultural Rights681

	Learning Objectives.....	681
	Questions	681
	Relevant Legal Instruments.....	682
1.	Introduction.....	683
2.	History Revisited: Why are there Two International Covenants on Human Rights?	683
	2.1 A chronological overview	683
	2.2. The substance of the debates	686
	2.2.1 <i>Principal arguments in favour of one covenant</i>	686
	2.2.2 <i>Principal arguments in favour of two covenants</i>	687
	2.2.3 <i>Pleadings in favour of a practical solution</i>	689
	2.2.4 <i>The question of justiciability</i>	690
3.	Interdependence and Indivisibility of Human Rights	692
4.	Universal and Regional Treaties for the Protection of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: The Rights Guaranteed	696
	4.1 The universal level.....	696
	4.1.1 <i>International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1966</i>	696
	4.2 The regional level	697
	4.2.1 <i>African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 1981</i>	697
	4.2.2 <i>American Convention on Human Rights, 1969, including the Additional Protocol in the Area of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1988</i>	698
	4.2.3 <i>European Social Charter, 1961, and European Social Charter (revised), 1996</i>	699
5.	The Legal Obligations of States to Protect Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	701
	5.1 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1966.....	701
	5.1.1 <i>Introductory remarks</i>	701
	5.1.2 <i>The obligation of conduct</i>	702

5.1.3	<i>The obligation of result</i>	703
5.1.4	<i>The obligation to give effect: the provision of domestic remedies</i>	704
5.2	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 1981	705
5.3	American Convention on Human Rights, 1969, and Additional Protocol in the Area of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1988	706
5.4	European Social Charter, 1961, and European Social Charter (revised), 1996.....	706
6.	Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: Are they Justiciable?	707
7.	Case Study I: The Right to Adequate Housing	710
7.1	Introductory remarks.....	710
7.2	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: article 11(1).....	711
7.2.1	<i>Persons covered by the right</i>	712
7.2.2	<i>Interpretative approach, including interdependence of rights</i>	713
7.2.3	<i>The concept of adequacy</i>	713
7.2.4	<i>Immediate legal obligations</i>	714
7.2.5	<i>Domestic remedies</i>	715
7.2.6	<i>Forced evictions</i>	716
7.3	Relevant European case law: The <i>Selçuk and Asker</i> case	719
7.4	Relevant domestic case law: The example of South Africa	721
8.	Case Study II: The Right to Health.....	730
8.1	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: article 12.....	730
8.1.1	<i>The normative content of article 12(1)</i>	731
8.1.2	<i>The meaning of the provisions in article 12(2)</i>	732
8.1.3	<i>The obligations of States parties</i>	734
8.1.4	<i>The core obligations</i>	736
8.1.5	<i>Violations of article 12</i>	737
8.1.6	<i>Implementation at the national level</i>	738
8.2	Relevant domestic case law I: The example of Canada.....	740
8.3	Relevant domestic case law II: The example of India	744
9.	The Role of Judges, Prosecutors and Lawyers in the Protection of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: Lessons Learned	748
10.	Concluding Remarks	748

Chapter 15 Protection and Redress for Victims of Crime and Human Rights Violations749

Learning Objectives.....749

Questions

Relevant Legal Instruments	750
1. Introduction.....	751
2. Protection and Redress for Victims of Crime	753
2.1 Relevant legal provisions.....	753
2.1.1 <i>The universal level</i>	753
2.1.2 <i>The regional level</i>	754
2.2 The notion of victim.....	756
2.3 Treatment of victims in the administration of justice	758
2.3.1 <i>Treatment of victims by the police</i>	758
2.3.2 <i>Treatment of victims by the prosecution</i>	761
2.3.3 <i>Questioning of victims during criminal procedures</i>	762
2.3.4 <i>Victims and criminal court proceedings</i>	763
2.3.5 <i>Victims' right to protection of their private life and their safety</i>	764
2.4 Restitution, compensation and assistance to victims of crime.....	765
2.4.1 <i>General remarks</i>	765
2.4.2 <i>Restitution</i>	766
2.4.3 <i>Compensation</i>	766
2.4.4 <i>Assistance</i>	771
3. Protection and Redress for Victims of Human Rights Violations	773
3.1 The notion of victim.....	774
3.2 The general legal duty to ensure the effective protection of human rights	776
3.2.1 <i>The universal level</i>	776
3.2.2 <i>The regional level</i>	776
3.3 The duty to prevent human rights violations.....	780
3.3.1 <i>The universal level</i>	780
3.3.2 <i>The regional level</i>	781
3.4 The duty to provide domestic remedies	783
3.4.1 <i>The universal level</i>	783
3.4.2 <i>The regional level</i>	786
3.5 The duty to investigate, prosecute and punish	792
3.5.1 <i>The universal level</i>	793
3.5.2 <i>The regional level</i>	796
3.5.3 <i>The role of victims during investigations and court proceedings</i>	799
3.6 The duty to provide redress for human rights violations	801
3.6.1 <i>Restitution and compensation</i>	801
3.6.2 <i>Rehabilitation</i>	803
3.7 The problem of impunity for human rights violations	805
3.7.1 <i>Impunity from a legal perspective</i>	805
3.7.2 <i>Justice, impunity and reconciliation</i>	808
4. The Role of Judges, Prosecutors and Lawyers in Ensuring Justice for Victims of Crime and Human Rights Violations.....	809
5. Concluding Remarks	809

Chapter 16	
The Administration of Justice During	
States of Emergency	811
Learning Objectives	811
Questions	811
Relevant Legal Instruments	812
1. Introduction	813
1.1 General introductory remarks	813
1.2 Introductory remarks on limitations and derogations in the field of human rights	814
2. The Notion of Public Emergency in International Human Rights Law	815
2.1 Relevant legal provisions	815
2.1.1 <i>Derogations and the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights</i>	816
2.2 Derogations from legal obligations: A dilemma for the drafters	816
2.3 The interpretation of the international monitoring bodies	821
2.3.1 <i>Article 4(1) of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</i>	821
2.3.2 <i>Article 27(1) of the American Convention on Human Rights</i>	825
2.3.3 <i>Article 15(1) of the European Convention on Human Rights</i>	827
3. Non-Derogable Rights and Obligations in International Human Rights Law	831
3.1 Introductory remarks	831
3.2 Relevant legal provisions	832
3.3 The right to life	833
3.4 The right to freedom from torture and from cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment	835
3.5 The right to humane treatment	837
3.6 The right to freedom from slavery and servitude.	838
3.7 The right to freedom from ex post facto laws and the principle of <i>ne bis in idem</i>	839
3.7.1 <i>The prohibition of ex post facto laws</i>	839
3.7.2 <i>The principle of ne bis in idem</i>	840
3.8 The right to recognition as a legal person	842
3.9 The right to freedom of thought, conscience and religion	842
3.10 The right not to be imprisoned merely on the ground of inability to fulfil a contractual obligation	843
3.11 The rights of the family	844
3.12 The right to a name	844

3.13	The rights of the child	845
3.14	The right to a nationality	846
3.15	The right to participate in government.....	847
3.16	Non-derogable rights and the right to effective procedural and judicial protection.....	847
4.	Derogable Rights and the Condition of Strict Necessity.....	852
4.1	General interpretative approach	853
4.1.1	<i>Article 4(1) of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</i>	853
4.1.2	<i>Article 27(1) of the American Convention on Human Rights</i>	854
4.1.3	<i>Article 15(1) of the European Convention on Human Rights</i>	855
4.2	The right to effective remedies	856
4.3.	The right to liberty and special powers of arrest and detention	857
4.4	The right to a fair trial and special tribunals	868
5.	The Condition of Consistency with Other International Legal Obligations	877
6.	The Condition of Non-Discrimination	879
7.	The Condition of International Notification.....	881
8.	The Role of Judges, Prosecutors and Lawyers in Ensuring the Effective Protection of Human Rights in Emergency Situations	884
9.	Concluding Remarks	885

NOTE

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Secretariat of the United Nations concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area, or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

*

* *

Material contained in this series may be freely quoted or reprinted, provided credit is given and a copy of the publication containing the reprinted material is sent to the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, United Nations, 1211 Geneva 10, Switzerland.

HR/P/PT/9

UNITED NATIONS PUBLICATION

<i>Sales No. E.02.XIV.3</i> ISBN 92-1-154141-7

ISSN 1020-1688
